



כולל הוראה  
ד'אמריקא  
Kollel Hora'ah of America

# תג הסמיכה

פסח שני תשע"ח

April 29, 2018

River Terrace, Lakewood NJ





**Four** years ago, when בעזרת ה' *my chaveirim and I, along with our visionary supporters, founded our Kollel, we had a dream. We dreamed that we could create a program which guides young תלמידי חכמים in their quest to become מורי הוראה and guiding lights to כלל ישראל. We dreamed of hasmadah, bekius, amkus, and Yiras Shomayim. But even in our dreams we could not have imagined how proud we would be of our dear Talmidim as they surpassed all expectations and took full advantage of every aspect of our program.*

*All of the Yungeleit who are receiving סמיכה tonight are fully deserving of the description הגיע להוראה, and each one shows great promise in their unique style of Rabbinic leadership.*

*This is the result of years of dedication, sacrifice, and hard work. Even with the daily intense sedorim, shiurim, and mussar, the monthly בחינות, periodic classes, and hands on training, the members of our Kollel showed their own initiative in creating additional projects which helped them on their way. One example is our weekly publication, Points to Ponder, which includes a succinct Vort on the Parsha as well as a דבר הלכה.*



*The special **רוח** did not end at the door to 31 Gordons Corner Road. In the car on the way to and from Kollel, and on the phones at night, the discussion continued. Shailos were shared, discussed, and hammered out until they were **זהב טהור**. The Yungeleit lived and breathed Shas, Rishonim, and Poskim without **הפסק**. This is what brought them to where they are today.*

*At this wonderful occasion, I thank Hashem for bringing us through it all and rewarding our efforts with success.*

*There are many individuals who deserve and have my deepest personal **הכרת הטוב**. First and foremost, all our Rebbetzins, who have stood by us and supported us throughout. Without them there would be nothing. My grandfather, HaRav Reuven Feinstein Shlit"א, for his constant advice and guidance. Rabbi Avraham Beren, for showing us all what true **התמדה** means, and whose daily guidance is indispensable to our Kollel. Rabbi Shmuel Goldstein, for delivering to us a great clarity in **פסק הלכה** and in his daily Shiurim. Our generous supporters, for their consistent aid and advice. The professionals who helped us with world class courses in many areas. Rabbi Yitzchok Oratz,*



*Rabbi Moshe Gewirtz, and the entire Monmouth Torah Links community, who warmly welcome our Kollel every day and provide the perfect location and situation for our learning and growth. The Kollel parents, who supported their children financially and otherwise enabling them attain their dreams. And of course, the Yungleit themselves, who make it all worth it.*

*A special thank you goes to Rabbi Moshe Dovid Berman, who really did much of the work arranging this event and journal, and to the other Kollel members who have taken on different responsibilities over the years.*

*As we put our trust in these young Poskim with the Semicha document, I am confident that it is well placed. It is impossible for us to know what the future holds, but one thing is certain. Wherever these special young מוסמים will go, they will be great role models and leaders. May we all enjoy much Nachas as we watch them guide and teach others and become the Gedolei Yisroel they set out to be.*

*Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg*

*Rosh HaKollel, Kollel Horaah of America*





לכבוד המוסמכים החשובים שיחיו

*Together we toiled. Together we worked. Together we celebrate.*

*With a heart full of joy, I reminisce on the beautiful years spent with these מוסמכים. From the first meeting, to the first חבורה, and on to the first בחינה. One step at a time we experienced the true meaning of מחיל אל חיל. We watched as fresh Yungeleit grew into full grown תלמידי חכמים. Every day another step forward. Every סוגיא another level higher. Every חבורה and every heated discussion, another leap closer to true clarity in Torah. Together we would delve into the depths of the Torah, and then like warriors in battle we would fight the מלחמתה של תורה until these מוסמכים חשובים emerged accomplished תלמידי חכמים.*

*With sharpened skills, they can approach any area of Torah and enjoy its true sweetness. They can recall areas throughout ש"ס and פוסקים as if they were learned yesterday and maneuver it with ease to analyze it with true clarity. These חברי הכולל can lead lives of true עובדי השם.*

Along with their skills in לימוד

הג הסמיכה תשע"ח



*התורה, they have grown in their ability to teach others, and to properly transmit Torah to the masses and to future generations. They have learned to explain the most difficult concepts to a layman, and teach יראת שמים to the non-believer.*

*יראת ה' היא אוצרו, such clarity in Torah is not acquired without concentration on יראת שמים. The Yungeleit have spent their years in the Kollel working on their character, learning the ways of Hashem through חכמה ומוסר and transmitting their thoughts on personal growth at the podium so that others can grow from them as well.*

*Their accomplishment is my joy and their success is my delight. I look forward to their future success in whichever path they choose.*

*Only with leadership can a people thrive. HaRav Mordechai Eisenberg שליט"א, founder and leader of the Kollel has given his all to the Yungeleit and the fruits of his labor are now ripe for the onlooker to see. The confidence that the מוסמכים have in making Halachic decisions is something that only HaRav Mordechai can teach, and the tools to make those decisions*



were imparted by a master in Halacha, HaRav Shmuel Goldstein שליט"א who spent countless hours giving over his knowledge of ערוך with clarity.

נשים במאי, I thank Hashem with all my heart for giving me the opportunity and wherewithal to take part in this great accomplishment. I owe a great debt of gratitude to my אשת חיל for standing behind me and taking everything on her shoulders so that I can concentrate on the Kollel. זכין, you have a great portion in the world to come. My parents who have taught me to grow, to excel and to give over, together with my in-laws who are always there to support their children, ואשרי חלקכם.

To the מוסמים, may Hashem guide you in your future and may you continue to grow in תורה ויראת שמים with health and happiness. May you be able to toil in Torah as we have done together מתוך מנוחה. הגפיש והרחבת הדעת. And may we merit the coming of משיח צדקינו במהרה בימינו.

באהבה בלב ונפש,

אברהם הלוי בירן





לכבוד המוסמכים חברי היקרים שליט"א

*It is hard to put into a few words the feelings I have towards every one of these חברי הכולל - מוסמכים חשובים. I have gained so much from each one, and I will forever be indebted to all of them.*

*How can I summarize close to 4 years of seeing each individual שטייג so much. Each one has grown in ידיעות התורה. Not only the specific areas of ש"ס and שלחן ערוך which they were tested on do they know well, but the entire canvas of life they are now painting with the colors of תורה and with the strokes of תורה. Each individual can not only answer a question, but can teach and give over the entire סוגיא behind that answer. Not only do they have the ability to transmit the body of the תורה to others, they can transmit the soul of the תורה as well – the reasons and the meanings.*

*One of the most humbling thoughts I have is thinking about where we all were just a few years ago and seeing where they are now. None of this would be possible without the vision, drive and dedication of the Rosh HaKollel הר' מרדכי איזנברג שליט"א.*

*Under his leadership, they have mastered the skills of learning, reviewing,*



*practically applying their knowledge, and so much more. Learning under the guidance and tutelage of Rav Avraham Beren is another factor which without this could not have occurred.*

*Since it is not my place to compliment those greater than me; I will simply say that HaRav Mordechai Eisenberg and Rav Avraham Beren are true transmitters of the תורה and true leaders of the עם התורה. The entire כלל ישראל is very fortunate to have them in their midst. We at the כולל הוראה are even more fortunate as we benefit from their direct influence.*

*Nobody knows what ד' has planned for each of these wonderful מוסמים, but they each have the tools necessary to succeed in their endeavors of ד'. Since their עבודת ד' is to do His רצון and they have our תורה הקדושה as their guide, they will בעזרת ד' be very מצליח in all that they do.*

*אסיים בברכת הדיוט. יהי רצון מלפני אבינו שבשמים שכל אחד מכם תזכה לעבוד ד' כל ימי חייו מתוך בריאת הגוף ומנוחת הנפש, ותזכה כל אחד שתשרה שכינה בכל מעשה ידיו, ותזכה כל אחד לראות רק הרבה נחת ממשפחתך. ונזכה כולנו לקבל פני מלך המשיח במהרה בימינו אמן.*

*באהבה, שמואל גולדשטיין*



*When I first accepted upon myself the responsibility of spearheading this Chag Hasmicha, I had no idea how rewarding it would be. The outpouring of support from parents, siblings, and friends overwhelmed me. We envisioned a small intimate event, which soon bloomed into well over double the amount of people expected. People flying in from across the country and Canada as well. We have received multiple request to place ads and join in the celebration. It is to that end which we present this addendum to our journal in attempt to allow as many people as possible be Mishtatef in our Simcha. My hope is that everyone enjoys this event and walks away inspired. We should all continue to see much Nachas from the wonderful Musmachim.*

*Moshe Dovid Berman*



**Rabbi  
Shmuel Katz**

Originally from Chicago, Rabbi Shmuel Katz is a Talmid of Edison Yeshiva. He spent 3 years in Eretz Yisroel, first in Yeshivas Dvar Torah led by Rav Menachem Eichenstein, and then learning Halacha from HaRav Yosef Lerner, culminating in Semicha. Upon returning to the states and marrying Esther Mina Krausz, R' Shmuel joined KHA to

broaden his depth of Halacha, while gaining additionally from the other programs offered by the Kollel.



Hailing from Passaic, New Jersey, Rabbi Moshe Orgel learned in Yeshiva of Staten Island for his formative years until going to Eretz Yisroel to learn Kodshim under HaRav Tzvi Kaplan. Upon returning to America, he joined BMG until his marriage to Aliza Beren, at which time he joined the Kollel of YSI, until, upon the recommendation of HaRav Reuven Feinstein, R' Moshe joined KHA.

**Rabbi  
Moshe Orgel**





***Rabbi  
Eliyahu Silver***

Rabbi Eliyahu Silver was born and raised in Detroit, Michigan. He remained in Detroit to learn in the famed Yeshiva Gedolah Ateres Mordechai of Greater Detroit. Upon his graduation from YGAM, R' Eliyahu married Chumi Miller of

Cleveland, Ohio, and joined BMG for five years before joining KHA upon its founding.



Raised in Far Rockaway, a talmid of the famed Philadelphia Yesiva, Rabbi Yonah Scheiner currently resides in Lakewood with his wife Shainy, nee Oratz, and their three sons. Yonah is a son-in-law of the Rav of Marlboro, Rabbi Yitzchok Oratz, and was recruited by Rabbi Eisenberg when the Kollel was started. In addition, R' Yonah is the founder and the driving force behind Points to Ponder, the Kollel's thought-provoking weekly.

***Rabbi  
Yonah Ahron Scheiner***





***Rabbi  
Yosef Stern***

Born and raised in Brooklyn, Rabbi Yosef Stern attended the Kaminetz and Mir Yeshivos. He subsequently studied under Rav Dovid Soloveitchik In Israel. Upon his return to the states, he joined BMG where he studied for two years. After his marriage to Haddas Shulman, Yossi was one of the founding members of Kollel Hora'ah of America.

He currently is a member of the Miami Beach community Kollel where he is involved in outreach.



Originally from Staten Island, Ahron attended Yeshiva of Staten Island until traveling to Eretz Yisroel to study under Reb Tzvi Kaplan in Yerushalaim. After returning from Eretz Yisroel and his marriage to Ranana Craven he continued in Staten Island in the Kollel there led by Harav Mordechai Eisenberg. It was there that Harav Eisenberg met Ahron and tapped him to start his new Kollel, Kollel Horaah of America.

***Rabbi  
Aharon Leeder***





***Rabbi  
Moshe Eisenberg***

Born in Chicago, Rabbi Moshe Eisenberg, a grandson of HaRav Reuven Feinstein, attended Yeshiva of Staten Island for high school before returning to Chicago to learn from Harav Avraham Chaim Levin in Telz Yeshiva. After returning from two years in Yeshivas Kodshim in Eretz Yisroel, he joined the Blatt Chaburah of Beis Medrash Gavoah. It is while he was a student of Beth Medrash Gavoah that he met his wife Hadassa Schron and set up his home in

Lakewood. Moshe continued in the Blatt Chaburah until joining the founding group of Kollel Horaah of America.

Rabbi Yechezkel Webster originates from Brooklyn, NY. Chesky learned from and remains a close Talmid of Harav Shmuel Perlstein of Lakewood NJ. Before joining Bais Medrash Gavoah Chesky spent close to two years in Yagdil Kodshim in Yerushalayim. While learning in Lakewood Chesky married Temmy Feldberger, before joining Kollel Horaah of America with the encouragement of Rabbi Perlstein.

***Rabbi  
Yechezkel Webster***





***Rabbi  
Eliezer Schecter***

Rabbi Eliezer Schecter is a third generation Quebecer. He came to the States to study in Yeshiva. Eli is a talmid of R' Meir Stern of Passaic, NJ. After learning for a few years in the Brisker Kollel in E"Y, Eli returned to the

states where he married Elisheva Spero of Cleveland, OH, prior to joining Kollel Horaah.



Born and raised in Lakewood NJ, after graduating from the Lakewood Cheder, Rabbi Moshe Dovid Berman attended Yeshiva of Staten Island for high school and Ba'is Medrash. He then learned in Yeshivas Kodshim in E"Y for two years. Upon his return to America he joined Beis Medrash Gavoah in Lakewood, and after his marriage to Brachie Mayo, joined the Blatt Chaburah until joining Kollel Hora'ah of America upon its inception.

***Rabbi  
Moshe Dovid Berman***







*Mazel Tov*

*May you continue to  
enrich כלל ישראל with  
your Torah and  
Avoda.*

*Hatzlacha in all your  
endeavors.*

*Rabbi and Mrs. Reuven  
Feinstein*



*Kollel Horaah would like  
to express its appreciation to*

**The Rebbetzins**

*and all*

**The Kollel Wives**

*for their support, care, and  
teamwork.*

*Our learning, our  
childrens' הצלחה, and our  
goals in life are only  
attainable through your  
dedication and  
partnership.*

שלי ושלכם שלה הוא



*In appreciation and in  
honor of our Rosh Kollel*

**HaRav Avrohom Beren**  
**שליט"א**

*Who fully represents all of  
the פרקי אבות listed in תורה קניני  
and stands as an example  
for anyone who desires to  
learn Torah על מנת ללמד.*

*May you be זוכה to share  
your light with נחת from all  
your talmidim  
עד ביאת גואל צדק במהרה בימינו*

*Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg,  
Rosh HaKollel*



*In appreciation and in  
honor of our Rosh Kollel*

**HaRav Shmuel Goldstein**

**שליט"א**

*Who is a world renowned  
מגיד שיעור פוסק, a dedicated  
and a true עבד השם.*

*For your warm patience,  
clear explanations, and  
constant dedication, may  
you be זוכה to continue to  
teach כלל ישראל and they be  
זוכה to learn from you  
עד ביאת גואל צדק במהרה בימינו*

*Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg,  
Rosh HaKollel*



*In honor of*

**Our Generous Supporters**

*with appreciation for making  
it all possible.*

*Thank you from the bottom  
of our hearts for your  
kindness and  
encouragement.*

*יהי רצון שתהי משכורתם שלמה מאת השם  
ולא ימוש התורה מפי זרעך וזרע זרעך עד עולם*

*Kollel Horaah of America*



*Kollel Horaah of America  
expresses its appreciation to*

**The Rabbis  
and Community  
of Monmouth Torah  
Links**

*for hosting us with  
warmth and love.*

*Thank you for everything*

*May we continue our  
partnership for many  
years to come*



לכבוד

**The מוסמכים**

*For the past four years, we have been like family, learning and growing together. It has been an honor to play a part in your journey.*

*Distance shall not diminish our brotherhood.*

*May we always have nachas from each other. I look forward to hearing great things from and about each and every one of you*

באהבה,  
*Mordechai*



*Kollel Horaah of America  
acknowledges the following Rabbanim  
and professionals who have shared  
their wisdom with us over the years.*

*We hope to have the opportunity to  
host you again as you teach new  
generations of talmidim at the Kollel.*

**HaRav Reuven Feinstein**

**HaRav Moshe Heinemann**

**HaRav Yisroel Dov Webster**

**HaRav Yitzchok Oratz**

**HaRav Eli Kaufman**

**HaRav Mordechai Twerski**

**Rabbi Doctor Ben Tzion Twerski**

**Mr. Avi Shulman**

**Rabbi Avi Shafran**

**Rabbi Ezra Max**

**Rabbi Moshe Gewirtz**

**Rabbi Yossi Kanelnski**



*Kollel Horaah of America  
thanks*

**Rabbi Moshe Dovid Berman**

*for his work in arranging this  
special event and this Journal,  
and wishes Rabbi Berman and  
his family Mazel Tov on their  
new daughter Rina who was  
born during preparation for the  
חג הסמיכה.*

*You are עוסק עם הצבור לשם שמים; the  
מסייע of the צבור should be זכות אבותם  
in the upbringing of your  
children.*

*צדקתם עומדת לעד*



*Kollel Horaah of America  
thanks*

**Rabbi Yaakov Guttman**  
*of*  
**Practical Yid Seminars**

*for bringing his informative  
courses on ספרות and שחיטה  
to the Kollel*



Agudath  
Israel  
of America  
אגודת ישראל באמריקה

8 Iyar, 5778  
April 23, 2018

It is an honor to congratulate, on behalf of Agudath Israel of America, the first graduating Semicha class of the Kollel Hora'ah of America, an institution that, under the leadership of Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg and the guidance of Rav Reuvain Feinstein, Shlit"א, has helped develop true Torah scholars with the requisite skills to assume leadership positions in the American Jewish community.

The Musmachim have mastered not only the complex halachic material requisite to the undertaking of Psak Halacha in modern times but have received extensive practical training as well that will allow them to render decisions and guide communities wisely.

May they and their Rabbaim go from Chayil el Choyil and have only continued Hatzlacha in all their endeavors.

Rabbi Avi Shafran  
Director of Public Affairs  
Agudath Israel of America

THE RABBI MOSHE SHERER NATIONAL HEADQUARTERS

42 Broadway • New York, NY 10004 • 212-797-9000 • Fax: 646-254-1600



## *Platinum*

ברוך שהחיינו וקיימנו והגיענו לזמן הזה  
ברוך הטוב והמיטב

מזל טוב מזל טוב מזל טוב

*What greater נחת could one ask for.*

*Mazal Tov to our son-in-law, the esteemed Rosh  
H'Kollel*

**Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg**

*And Mazal Tov to Our Son, the esteemed Maggid  
Shiur*

**Rabbi Avrohom Beren**

*on this momentous achievement of creating,  
forming and molding the future Rabbonim of Klal  
Yisroel with your first Musmachim to graduate  
from your Kollel.*

*And a special Mazal Tov to our son-in-law*

**Rabbi Moshe Orgel**

*on your graduation from this esteemed program,  
to become one of the future Rabonim of Klal  
Yisroel.*

*May this be the start of a very rewarding future for  
all of us and Klal Yisroel*

*Rabbi Shea & Nechama Beren*



## *Platinum*

*To our Bechor*

### **the esteemed Rosh Kollel**

*You were born immersed in an environment of Gadlus HaTorah and Yiras Shamayim and Adinus HaRuach. Baruch Hashem, you are using these gifts for the purpose they were intended.*

*All honor to you and to*

### **Shira**

*for the foresight, courage, sacrifice, and discipline to lead all those around you to achieve what they could not have achieved without you.*

*With love and admiration,  
Daddy and Mommy Eisenberg*



*Platinum*

*Mazal Tov to our dear  
grandson*

**Moshe Eisenberg**

*upon his receiving סמיכה.*

*We are very proud of this  
accomplishment.*

*May you and*

**Hadassa**

*go מחיל אל חיל in the  
footsteps of your  
illustrious family בעזרת ה'.*

*Zaidy & Bobby Schron*



*Platinum*

*Mazel Tov*

**Ernie**

*We are very  
proud*



*Platinum*

*To*

**our youngest Rav**

רוח גדולה וחזק מפרק הרים ומשבר  
סלעים... לא ברוח ה' ואחר הרוח  
רעש לא ברעש ה' ואחר הרעש אש  
לא באש ה' ואחר האש קול דממה  
דקה

*The deepest waters run  
with the least sound.*

*All our love and pride to  
you and*

**Hadassa**

*Daddy and Mommy  
Eisenberg*



*Platinum*

לכבוד

**הרבנים חתני הנשף**

מורי הוראה ומאירי מסילה

יהי רצון שיתן לכם הקדוש  
ברוך הוא נחלה בלי מְצָרִים  
להפיץ מעיינותיכם חוצה  
לנחת משפחותיכם ולטובת  
תלמידיכם וקהילותיכם וכל  
ישראל

אליעזר ומלכי איזנברג



## *Platinum*

*Mazel Tov to חתנו היקר*

**Moshe**

*upon this momentous  
accomplishment!*

*We are overwhelmed with  
gratitude for the privilege of  
having you in our family. Your  
abilities coupled with your sense of  
responsibility, your sensitivity to  
others and your calm and gentle  
nature are traits to be treasured.*

*We are so proud of you and*

**Hadassa**

*and wish you tremendous הצלחה in  
all your future endeavors.*

*Love,*

*Ima and Abba Schron*



*Platinum*

*In honor of our dear  
son-in-law*

**Rav Avrohom Beren**

*We are very proud of your  
accomplishments.*

*May you continue to have  
continued הרבצת in הצלחה  
התורה.*

*Love,  
Mommy and Abba Aber*

*Mazal tov to all the מוסמים*

# Platinum



70 Amboy Road, Morganville, NJ 07751 • Tel 732-377-9551 • Info@monmouthtorahlinks.org

*One Community.  
One People.  
Many Links.*

"וכן קורין לתלמידי חכמים חברים. וקראום בשם זה מפני שחברותם זה לזה היא החברות האמתית  
מפני שהיא לשם שמים"  
(פה"מ להרמב"ם, דמאי פרק ב' משנה ג')

"ואהבת את ה' אלהיך - שיהא שם שמים מתאהב על ידך, שיהא קורא ושונה ומשמש תלמידי  
חכמים, ויהא משאו ומתנו בנחת עם הבריות, מה הבריות אומרות עליו - אשרי אביו שלמדו תורה,  
אשרי רבו שלמדו תורה. אי להם לבריות שלא למדו תורה, פלוני שלמדו תורה - ראו כמה נאים  
דרכיו, כמה מתוקנים מעשיו, עליו הכתוב אומר ויאמר לי עבדי אתה ישראל אשר בך אתפאר"  
(יומא פ"ו ע"א)

A tremendous MAZAL TOV to

## Kollel Hora'ah of Marlboro

under the leadership of

*Moreinu* Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg  
along with

Rabbi Avraham Beren & Rabbi Shmuel Goldstein

upon their inaugural

## חג הסמיכה

## Monmouth Torah Links

is proud to be the host location for this distinguished Kollel.

We have great gratitude to all of tonight's *musmachim* for the unique contribution each one has made to our community.

ברכותינו שכל או"א, איש איש לפי מהללו יהוולל, יעלה ויצליח להפיץ מעינותיו ויוסף אומץ  
להגביר חילו להרביץ ולהרבות תורה לתפארת ישראל!

**Rabbi Yitzchok Oratz**

& Rabbi Moshe Gewirtz

On behalf of the Monmouth Torah Links community



*Gold*

*to the Kollel  
Horaah of America*

*to all the מוסמים,  
and especially to*

**הרב אליעזר זאב שכטר  
שליט"א**

*ילכו מחיל אל חיל*

*Bubby,  
Tatty,  
Moishe & Chaya,  
Yaakov & Michal*



*Gold*

*To my wife*

**Brachie**

*this event would not have  
been possible without you.*

*Thank you for putting up  
with late nights, phone calls,  
emails, texts, and deadlines.*

*May we share continued  
Nachas from our children  
for many happy years to  
come.*

*Moishe*



*Gold*

*In honor of our amazing  
brother*

**Eli Schecter**

*We are so proud of you!  
Continue to do great  
things!*

*Wishing you lots of ברכה  
and הצלחה*

*Yitzy and Chavi Schecter  
Shuey and Chaya Toba Juravel*



*Gold*

*With great הכרת הטוב to*

**Rabbi Eisenberg**

*and the הנהלה*

*Mazal Tov to*

**ר' אליהו סילבר**

*and the choshuve  
talmidim.*

*Mommy & Tatty Silver and  
the entire Mishpacha*



*Gold*

מים עמוקים עצה בלב איש ...

*Thank you*

הרה"ג ר' מרדכי איזנברג שליט"א

*for envisioning this Kollel. For  
charting this path, and for  
inviting me to join on this  
wonderful journey.*

...ואיש תבונה ידלנה

**Rav Shmuel Goldstein**

**Rav Avrohom Beren**

*For working so hard to actualize  
this dream and bringing it to  
fruition.*

תלמידך

משה דוד ברמן וב"ב



## Gold

לכבוד

הראש כולל ר' מרדכי איזנברג שליט"א

*From the depths of my heart I wish you a טוב מזל on this next milestone in your הרבצת התורה – the סמיכה of your תלמידים receiving כולל.*

*Not only are you my רבי and my חברותא, you are also my role model. It has been a זכות and a pleasure to see how much you have done for כלל ישראל. From being a ראש חבורה in YSI to being a Rav in Marlboro, from starting a night כולל which connected יונגרייט with בעלי בתים to starting this wonderful כולל leading them to סמיכה and beyond; through it all your intent, your goal, your drive, and your success was to be מרבה כבוד שמים.*

*Obviously, none of this could have been accomplished without the backing, and pushing, of your Rebbetzin. She has given her all and then some to support each and every one of your endeavors.*

*Thank you Rabbi and Rebbetzin Eisenberg! May the two of you continue to have loads of תלמידים from all your children and נחת!*

Shmuel Goldstein



*Gold*

*Mazal Tov*

*to*

**Rabbi Yonah and  
REBBETZIN Shainy Scheiner**

*&*

*Rabbis in training*

**Pinny, Baruch, and Tzvi Pesach**

**עמושי"ט**

*on tonight's special occasion!*

*We knew you just couldn't get enough of  
the Marlboro connection! :)*

יה"ר שיזכו להמשיך להיות מקור מלא כף נחת, ברכות  
שמים מעל ועל הארץ מתחת, ונזכה ונחיה ונראה כולנו  
יחד רוב נחת ועונג ושובע שמחות מכל צאצאינו וצאצאי  
צאצאינו היקרים, כולם זרע ברוכי ה', מתוך בריות גופא  
ונהורא מעליא, דורות ישרים מבורכים, עטרת זקנים בני  
בנים ותפארת בנים אבותם!

*Totty and Mommy Oratz and Family*



*Gold*

*In honor of the esteemed*

ראש הכולל

מוריניו הרב מרדכי איזנברג

*In honor of the esteemed*

**members of the Kollel  
Horaah**

*Mazel Tov on your  
amazing  
accomplishments.*

יה"ר שהשפעת הכולל תמשך

לארבע כנפות הארץ

*Rabbi Moshe Gewirtz*



*Gold*

*A special thank you to*

**Mr. Steve Dubey**  
*of Chicago*

*for helping with some of the  
ads in the journal, and for  
all your help and support in  
the past.*

*We wish you, שמואל אברם בן,  
יוספינה, a full recovery really  
soon.*

*May you be Zoche to  
continue to learn Torah and  
do Mitzvos for many years  
to come.*

*Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg*



## *Gold*

*In honor of our amazing*

### **N'shei Kollel Hora'ah**

*The incredible breadth of  
knowledge your husbands have  
gained and the growth they have  
achieved in the past four years is  
all due to you.*

*This program can proudly  
proclaim on each and every one  
of you,*

*"שלי ושלכם שלה הוא."*

*With admiration and ברכות for  
continued success,*

*Shira Eisenberg*

*Naomi Beren*

*Nechama Miriam Goldstein*



*Silver*

*To our wonderful son-in-law*

**Moishe Berman**

*Mazal Tov on receiving your  
S'micha! We know you worked  
very hard to reach this goal  
and we are so proud of you.*

*You are a valuable asset to  
your community and to Klal  
Yisroel.*

*May הקב"ה always shower you  
with abundant Torah blessings.  
We are so happy that you are a  
part of our family and we love  
you!*

*Mom and Abba Mayo*



## Silver

זה היום קוינו לו נגילה ונשמחה בו  
חג הסמיכה חג הסיום

אשר נכתר בעטרה של תורה והוראה בישראל

**הרב ר' אהרן לידר שליט"א**

אנו משפחתו מתכבדים בכבודו מוצלחים  
בהצלחתו ושמחים בשמחתו

ומברכים אותך ואת נוות ביתך שתחי' העומדת  
עזר כנגדך לרוב ברכה בכל מעשיך, וברב נחת  
מכל צאצאיכם שיחיו, בָּנֵנו אָחֵינוּ

שמעון אלסטער ורעיתו  
יצחק ארי' ובלומא לידר  
אפרים וטובא ראבינאוויץ  
יוסף וחנה שלומאוויץ  
צבי ובת שבע פריידמאן  
משה דוב וציפורה בארנשטיין  
ישראל מאיר וחנה פיגא לידר  
צבי דוב וחווה לידר  
ירחמיאל לידר



*Silver*

תשואות חן והכרת הטוב  
מעומקא דלבא  
לכבוד ראש הכולל הנאמן

**מהר"ר מרדכי איזנברג  
שליט"א**

על כל הטוב אשר גמלנו  
יה"ר שיאריך ימים על מלאכתו

בברכת תלמידו  
יוסף שטערן



*Silver*

**Dearest**

**Tatty**

A Tatty like you is a rare find,  
You're really special, you're one of a kind.  
You shteig away day and night,  
You learn Torah with all your might.  
You've accomplished so much in just a few  
years,  
Now all our shailos can be answered without  
any fears,  
'Cuz besides being a Tatty you're a Rabbi too.  
Tatty, we're really very proud of you!

Love,

**Nechama & Rina Berman  
and of course Mommy!**



*Silver*

*Kollel Horaah of America  
thanks all those who have  
contributed to making  
this evening a success*

**Rabbi Shmuel Katz**  
**Rabbi Moshe Eisenberg**  
**Rabbi Aharon Leeder**

*It couldn't have been  
done without you!*

*Moishe Berman*



*Silver*

*To our*

**Daddy**

*We're so so proud of you!*

*All your busy days (Bein  
Hazmanim? What's Bein  
Hazmanim?!) and late  
nights (Wait! Is 4am night  
or day?!) are paying off.*

*We love you!*

*Yaakov, Moshe, Shana,  
Shimi, Ahron, Yekusiel*

*and*

*Mommy*



*Mazel Tov*

**Moishe and Brachie  
Berman**

*We are so proud of you*

*Tatty & Mommy & the Family*

יהי רצון מלפני אבינו שבשמים שתזכה  
לעלות מעלה מעלה על במתי תורה  
והוראה. ותזכה להורות לעם השם הדרך  
שילכו בו, ומעשה אשר יעשו. ולעורר  
יראת השם בלבם ויקדש שם שמים בכל  
דרכיך.



*In honor of my son*

**Rabbi Shmuel Goldstein**

*and his special family who  
wholeheartedly support all his  
heiligah endeavors.*

*His אשת חיל Nechama Miriam and  
his בלי עין הרע beautiful children  
Goldie, Sima Leah, Avraham  
Yeshayahu, Binyomin, Chaya,  
Ephraim Fishel and Yehuda Leib  
always encourage him to keep  
Torah alive.*

*May they be blessed by הקב"ה with  
הצלחה בכל מעשי ידיהם לעולם.  
May they  
continue to go מחיל אל חיל.*

*Phyllis Goldstein*



לכבוד

**R' Yechezkel Webster**

עמו"ש

*May you continue to be a  
source of נחת to the רבש"ע,  
to כלל ישראל, and the  
family.*

*Tatty, Mommy, Sruli, Frumie,  
Yosef, Shira, and Eli*



לכבוד מורינו

**הרב מרדכי איזנברג שליט"א**

**מְסִרְתָּ לֵב וּנְפֶשׁ עַל הַצְלַחְתֵּינוּ**

**ויהי רצון מלפני אבינו שבשמים שיהיו  
נטיעותיך כמותך, ושתזכה להעמיד  
תלמידים רבים והגונים  
ראויים להוראה**

**המוסמכים**

הרב אהרן לידר	הרב משה יהושע אורגיל
הרב אליהו סילבר	הרב משה איזנברג
הרב יוסף דוד שטרן	הרב משה דוד ברמן
הרב יונה אהרן שיינער	הרב יחזקאל שלמה וועבסטער
הרב אליעזר זאב שכטר	הרב שמואל יצחק הכהן כ"ץ



לא כחל ולא שרק ולא פירכוס ויעלת חן (סנהדרין יד.)

אפריון נמטייה לגיסי היקר אב בחכמה ורך בשנים  
כליל המעלות נועם המדות נאה דורש ומקיים

**הרב שמואל יצחק הכהן כ"ץ שליט"א**

שזכה בעמלתו הַרְבֵּה של הרבה שנים לירד לעומקא  
דדינא ולבררה למעשה  
עד שזכה ליכתר לרב בישראל  
"יורו משפטיך ליעקב ותורתך לישראל"

יהא רעוא מלעילא שרוכב שמים יהיה בעזרך  
ותזכה להוסיף אומץ בתורתך ולזכות את הרבים כרצונך  
בבריות גופא ונהורא מעליא עד ביאת גוא"צ בב"א

"מנשים באהל תבורך"

אחותי החשובה נות ביתו שתחי' שעומדת על ימינו תמיד  
יה"ר שתמיד תזכה לשמוח בפרי עמלה  
וביחד תרוו הרבה נחת דקדושה מכל יוצאי חלציתם  
אכי"ר

מנחם ומרים קרויס



*To our most wonderful son*

**Aharon**

*on this monumental  
accomplishment.*

*תלמוד תורה כנגד כולם state חז"ל  
and you have truly lived up to their  
dictum.*

*May you and your wonderful  
אשת חיל and your terrific  
Kinderlach continue on the  
path of תורה, עבודת ה', וחסד  
health and gezunt.*

*All our love  
Mommy & Tatty*



*In honor of*

**Yonah & Shainy  
Scheiner**

*Mazal Tov on this  
tremendous occasion.*

*Wishing you continued ברכה  
והצלחה.*

*Mordechai Zvi, Nechama &  
Pesach Geller*



*In honor of our dear son and  
brother*

**Rabbi Shmuel Yitzchok Katz**  
שליט"א

*We are all so proud of you that  
you have reached such a huge  
milestone in your life.*

*May ה' bless you that you should  
go מחיל אל חיל in all your  
endeavors, and may we continue  
to see only true Yiddishe Nachas  
from you and your אשת חיל Esther  
Mina and your beautiful family.*

*Love, your parents  
Rabbi Moshe & Leah Katz (Chicago)  
and all your siblings*



מזל טוב לחתגנו כבגנו

הר"ר יוסי שטרן שליט"א

כל מן דין סמוכו לנא

*Mazal Tov to our wonderful  
son-in-law Rabbi Yossi Stern  
and his אשת חיל Hadas  
on this momentous occasion.*

*May you go together אל מחיל  
חיל.*

*Sabba & Savta Shulman  
Bubby Rabinowitz  
Abba & Ima Shulman*



*In honor of our dear  
son*

**יחזקאל שלמה נ"י**

*upon receiving his  
Smicha, and to all the  
Musmachim*

*Rabbi & Mrs. Yisroel  
Webster & Family*



*In honor of*

**Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg**

*for envisioning, crafting, and realizing this  
extraordinary program.*

*All can observe greatness. Many may absorb  
it. Some might embody it. But few can  
transmit it.*

*With idealism and altruism, Rabbi Eisenberg  
transmits the greatness which he has come to  
embody, and seeks to endow others with  
effective knowledge and the ability to use  
knowledge effectively.*

*We here today attest that he has found what  
he seeks.*

*May he, along with his colleagues*

**Rabbi Avrohom Beren**

*and*

**Rabbi Shmuel Goldstein**

*merit the ultimate satisfaction of seeing the  
positive and lasting impact of their labors.*

*Rabbi & Mrs. Moshe & Hadassa Eisenberg*



*In honor of*

**Rebbetzin Shira Eisenberg**

*who has been a powerful and driving force in all manner of ancillary and auxiliary KHA capacities, from active participation in funding initiatives to nurturing the welcoming environment which we here at the Kollel enjoy along with our families.*

*May she, along with*

**Rebbetzin Naomi Beren**

*and*

**Rebbetzin Nechama Goldstein**

*merit the profound satisfaction of knowing that their efforts are always, always appreciated.*

*Rabbi & Mrs. Moshe & Hadassa Eisenberg*



*In honor of*

**Da Ruv**

*Wow! Your leaving  
quite the path for me  
to live up to!*

*May you continue  
shteiging!*

*From your younger  
brother*



*In honor of our dear*

**Yonah שיחיי**

*Mazal Tov on this great  
milestone. We wish you  
Brocha & Hatzlocho in  
all your future  
endeavors.*

יהי רצון שתלך מחיל אל חיל

*With love and  
admiration,  
Bubby Rubinson & Family*



לכבוד הרב ר' מרדכי שליט"א ורעייתו

*Thank you for establishing the unique מקום תורה of Kollel Horaah. It has given me the opportunity to be גולה למקום תורה in the truest sense. It is an environment where I was able to learn knowing that everything I needed to be מצליח would be provided for.*

*The הדרכה you provided, together with your belief and confidence in your תלמידים, is what propelled us to reach this momentous milestone.*

יהי רצון שיתן לך הקב"ה כח ובריאות להמשיך עבודתך הקדושה, ללמוד וללמד, להעמיד תלמידים הרבה ולהדריךכם לעלות על במתי תורה ועבודה, להיות מורי הוראה ומדריכי בני ישראל לרבים וליחידים.

ברגשי הוקרה וברכה,

*Eliyahu & Chumi Silver*



לכבוד ראשי הכולל שליט"א

הרב אברהם בירן  
הרב שמואל גולדשטיין

מְסִרְתָּ לֵב וּנְפֶשׁ עַל הַצְלַחַתֵּינוּ  
וְיְהִי רְצוֹן שְׁתַּשְׂרֶה שְׂכִינָה בְּמַעֲשֶׂה  
יְדֵיכֶם, וְתִזְכּוּ לְהַעֲמִיד תַּלְמִידִים רַבִּים  
וְהַגּוֹנִים

באהבה, תלמידיכם

הרב אהרן לידר	הרב משה יהושע אורגיל
הרב אליהו סילבר	הרב משה איזנברג
הרב יוסף דוד שטרן	הרב משה דוד ברמן
הרב יונה אהרן שיינער	הרב יחזקאל שלמה וועבסטער
הרב אליעזר זאב שכטר	הרב שמואל יצחק הכהן כ"ץ



*Mazal Tov to our nephew*

**Rabbi Shmuel Katz**

*and his אשת חיל*

**Esther Mina**

*upon his receiving סמיכה.*

*May you continue to have  
much הצלחה in all your  
endeavors.*

*Uncle Hanie & Tante Suri  
Morgenstern*

*Tante Toby Rose Morgenstern*

*Uncle Nasanel & Tante Nancy  
Yachnes*

*Uncle Yisroel and Tante Chany  
Hecht*



אביע רננות ורגשי הכרת הטוב  
להני צנתרי דדהבא

מהר"ר אברהם בירן  
מהר"ר שמואל גולדשטיין

על כל טובם עמדי ועם שאר  
חברי הכולל

יאריך ה' ימיהם בנעימים

בנפש,  
יוסף שטערן



*לכבוד my grandson*

**Chesky**

*I want to wish you a  
very special Mazel  
Tov upon this  
beautiful  
accomplishment.*

*You have tremendous  
מנהיג to be a כחות.*

*הצלחה רבה*

*Babi*



ברוב שבח והודאה  
ברכת מזל טוב לבתננו היקרה

אסתר מינא שתחי'  
ולבעלה היקר  
שמואל יצחק הכהן נ"י

לרגל נסמך להוראה "בסמיכות חכמים" ולאסוקי  
שמעתתא אליבא דהילכתא.

יהי רצון שיזכה להגדיל תורה ולהאדירה עד כי יבוא  
שילה, ותזכו לראות רב נחת וענוג דקדישא מצאצאיים  
חי' שתחי' ובילא צירל שתחי' עוסקים במצוות.

זרעא חיא וקימא, וחי אריכי, ומזוני רויחי, וסיעתא  
דשמיא, ובריות גופא, ונהורא מעליא, וישלח ברכה  
והצלחה בכל מעשה ידיכם, אמן.

באהבה,  
אביך ואמך

גם אנו מצטרפים לברך אתכם בשמחה ונחת וכל טוב,  
חני, רבקי, בלימי, חיים, שלום, שיינדי, משה, ומוטי



*Mazal Tov to our dear  
grandchildren*

**Shmuli & Esther Mina**

**שיהיו**

*upon receiving סמיכה. We  
are very proud of you and  
your accomplishments.*

*May you, together with  
Chaya and Baila שתחי,  
continue to bring much נחת  
to our family in the best of  
health, with lots of שמחה  
and נחת.*

*With love,  
Zaidy & Bubby Yachnes*



ויהללוה בשערים מעשיה

*A great thank you to the  
Rebbetzins*

**Rebbetzin Beren  
and  
Rebbetzin Goldstein**

*for all their efforts and  
support.*

חברי הכולל

הרב אהרן לידר	הרב משה יהושע אורגיל
הרב אליהו סילבר	הרב משה איזנברג
הרב יוסף דוד שטרן	הרב משה דוד ברמן
הרב יונה אהרן שיינער	הרב יחזקאל שלמה וועבסטער
הרב אליעזר זאב שכטר	הרב שמואל יצחק הכהן כ"ץ



*A big thank you to*

**Rebbetzin Shira Eisenberg**

*for all that she has done, and  
continues to do, for the  
Kollel.*

לא יכבה בלילה נרה

יהי רצון שתזכה יחד אם בעלה לבנים

ובנות שלמים בתורה ויראת שמים

עד ביאת גואל צדק בב"א

חברי הכולל

הרב אהרן לידר

הרב אליהו סילבר

הרב יוסף דוד שטרן

הרב יונה אהרן שיינער

הרב אליעזר זאב שכטר

הרב משה יהושע אורגיל

הרב משה איזנברג

הרב משה דוד ברמן

הרב יחזקאל שלמה וועבסטער

הרב שמואל יצחק הכהן כ"ץ



*To the newly minted Rebbetzins*

**Rebbetzin Brachie Berman**

**Rebbetzin Hadassa Eisenberg**

**Rebbetzin Esther Mina Katz**

**Rebbetzin Ranana Leeder**

**Rebbetzin Aliza Orgel**

**Rebbetzin Shainy Scheiner**

**Rebbetzin Chumi Silver**

**Rebbetzin Elisheva Schecter**

**Rebbetzin Hadas Stern**

**Rebbetzin Temmi Webster**

*We couldn't have done it without you!*



*In honor of the Rosh Hakollel*

**HaRav Mordechai Shlit”a**

*Thank you so much for your continuous guidance, looking out for what’s needed for each one of us and all the hard work that goes into being a Rosh Kolllel (probably a lot more than we can imagine!)*

*In honor of*

**HaRav Avrohom Beren Shlit”a**

*We can’t thank you enough for all those kochoes you put into preparing first seder, sharing it with us, and guiding us through out the sugyas while working together with R’ Mordechai and R’ Shmuel making sure all is running well!*

*In honor of*

**HaRav Shmuel Goldstein Shlit”a**

*Just being in the presence of a Talmid Chochom like R’ Shmuel is a Zechus I don’t take for granted. On top of that the Shiurim we get to hear daily is something we wait eagerly each day, information that we use “literally” on a daily basis.*

*אחרון אחרון חביב- מזל טוב מזל טוב!  
To my dear choshuva chaverim*

**the new Rabbis**

*If writing ads would be free I probably would have written individual adds expressing my gratitude towards each one of you. I can truly say that I gained so much from being part of a group of Yungerleit with so many מעילות each one contributing in their own way! I hope by the time it’s my turn to celebrate this wonderful event בשש”י I will be able to answer those בשש”י questions as clearly as all of you!*

*May you all utilize your great kochoes growing and helping others grow closer to Hashem.*

*P.S. can’t finish this ad without thanking*

**Rabbi Oratz, Rabbi Gewirtz and the whole MTL community**

*for the constant chizuk they give.*

*Moishe Pinter*



לכבוד *our dear brother in law*

הרב אהרן לידר נ"י

מזל טוב *on your receiving סמיכה we are  
amazed by all that you have  
accomplished.*

*May you continue to use your  
tremendous כוחות to benefit all of כלל  
ישראל.*

*Shua & Nini  
Adam & Shanea  
Yehuda & Sori  
Yosef Tzvi & Bassy  
Yoni & Yehudis  
Yitzi & Shoshie  
Tzvi & Devora  
Dovid  
Sara*



*Mazal tov to the Rosh HaYeshiva*  
**Rabbi Mordechai Eisenberg**  
*on this wonderful and beautiful  
simcha.*

*And Mazal Tov to*  
**Rabbi Moshe Eisenberg**  
*on this exciting achievement.*

*We are so proud of your  
accomplishments!!*

*Love,*  
*Avram and Ita*  
*Moshe and Tzivia*  
*Shlomo and Shaindy*



לכבוד

הנהלת כולל הוראה ומשפחתם

, ובראש,

הראש הכולל הרב מרדכי שליט"א

*Thank you for the unbelievable amount of work you put in to us. You didn't rest for years because of your dedication and commitment to us. Thank you for instilling the values and the knowledge that we need to achieve what we are today and for giving us the foundations that will forever impact our future growth.*

רב אברהם שליט"א

*Thank you for the immeasurable amount we learned from you. Your תורה in חיות and התמדה is an example for all those around you.*

רב שמואל שליט"א

*You give us הדרכה Thank you for your valuable learn from זכות it is a tremendous, והשקפה, הלכה in someone who knows how to say I don't know, but rarely ever needs to say it.*

*Eliezer Schecter*



*Mazal tov to our dear  
brother*

**Yona Scheiner**

*on this accomplishment.  
We're very proud of you.  
May you continue to have  
much הצלחה in all your  
endeavors.*

*Eli & Henna  
Menachem Osher & Yocheved  
Yoni & Sora Tzivia*



*To our dear son*

**Yossi**

*and his אשת חיל*

**Hadas**

*עמו"ש, with our deepest  
wishes of continued siyata  
dishmaya. May הקב"ה rain  
down upon you שפע ברכות.*

*מזל טוב מזל טוב*

*Ta & Ma*



*Thanks to all those whose support has  
made this possible*

*On the home front,*

**Esther Mina תחי'**

*There is no way this could have happened  
without your unfailing support and  
devotion!*

**Totty and Mommy Katz**

*For 27 years- and counting- of support!*

**Totty and Mommy Krausz**

*For all the various ways you support us!*

*And in Kollel*

**הרב מרדכי איזנברג שליט"א**

*For having a dream and bringing it to life*

**הרב שמואל גולדשטיין שליט"א**

**הרב אברהם הלוי בירן שליט"א**

*Getting to know you has been two of the  
greatest benefits of joining the Kollel!*

*שמואל יצחק הכהן*



*In honor of all those who  
take part in the  
publication of*

**Points to Ponder**

*and in particular*

**Rabbi Moshe Eisenberg**

*Yonah Scheiner, Editor*



*In honor of the רב השכונה*

### **Rabbi Oratz**

*This Simcha is yours as well. Besides being the esteemed host of the kollel, you are the pillar of the community within which it is contained.*

*The feelings the community members have toward the kollel come from their leader, and the way the חברי הכולל conduct themselves is due to your example.*

*The Mishna in Avos says במקום שאין איש השתדל איש, להיות איש, simply meaning; when there is no man to fulfill the job try to take on the role yourself.*

*The ספר רוח חיים has a different explanation; when no man is around to see what you are doing try your best to do best and be the best man you can be.*

*This is what Rabbi Oratz personifies. Out in Marlboro, away from most of the Yeshiva world, Rabbi Oratz sits in his house and learns day and night. His התמדה is what holds up the town of Marlboro and is something we at the Kollel emulate.*

*May Hashem grant you the strength and ability to continue to have a positive influence on אחינו בני ישראל.*

*Avrohom and Naomi Beren*



לכבוד

הרה"ג ר' מרדכי איזנברג שליט"א

והראשי כולל שליט"א

ר' שמאל גאלדשטיין שליט"א  
ור' אברהם בירן שליט"א

*Thank you all for the extremely  
vital role you each had in  
helping us reach this very  
precious milestone in our lives.  
All your hard work is greatly  
appreciated.*

*Chesky & Temmy Webster*



לכבוד הראש הכולל

הרה"ג ר' מרדכי

שליט"א

ולכבוד המוסמך החדש

ר' משה איזנברג

יה"ר שתלכו מחיל אל חיל

מאת אחיכם שלמה ומשפחתו



לכבוד

מוריננו רב מרדכי איזנברג

רב אברהם בירן

רב שמואל גלדשטיין

*It is not simply the leadership  
with which you guided us that  
we celebrate, rather it is the  
attention which you gave,  
ensuring that our questions were  
answered and our answers were  
in turn questioned.*

*The knowledge gained and  
potential unlocked knows no  
bounds.*

*Thank you for the guidance, the  
direction, and for helping us  
reach our goal.*

*Moshe and Aliza Orgel*



*To our dearest grandchild*

**Chesky**

*on the occasion of him receiving  
his smicha after much time and  
effort in working towards this  
great honor.*

*You should be zoche to utilize the  
knowledge that you have learned  
to build a better home for yourself  
and your family, and to also  
share this knowledge with klal  
yisroel in order to accomplish the  
goal of *להגדיל תורה ולהאדיר*.*

*We are very proud of you.*

*With love,  
Your Zaidy and Babby*



מזל טוב לאחינו היקר

הר' יונה אהרן שיינער  
שליט"א

לרגל קבלת סמיכת חכמים.  
יהי רצון שתמשיך לעלות  
מחיל אל חיל

מנחם ומרים שיינער



*Mazal tov*

**HaRav Moish**

*May you continue to  
learn and teach the  
תורה הקדושה in your  
wonderfully unique  
and inspiring way.*

*באהבה והוקרה,*

*The Lazars*



*As preparations were ongoing for this evening,  
I received warm messages from many people who  
could not be here this evening but are here with us  
in spirit and with their continuing support. I would  
like to take this opportunity to share some of their  
wishes.*

*מזל טוב. הרבה נחת. אנו גאים על הזכות להיות שותפים להשיג זה.  
כה לחי, משלמה*

*-Shlomo Eisenberg, B'nei Berak*

*I heard the great news from your parents. They are  
"kvelling" and so are we all. Continued Hatzlocha.*

*-Tzvi Ray, Chicago*

*Mazel Tov to you and Shira! So much effort goes  
into a Simcha such as this...Hatzlocha Raba in all  
your endeavors B"EH*

*-Rebbetzin Faskowitz, Hillcrest*

*Mazal tov! Continued success!*

*-Shimmy Webster, Chicago*

*I have nachas just from hearing!*

*-Yehuda Feinstein, Lakewood*

*מזל און ברכה!!!*

*-Rabbi Yekusiel Stern, Miami*

*And many, many more. Thank you to everyone  
who joins with us in their support and Berachos.  
You are all so important to our vital work.*



*Mazal Tov Mazal Tov  
to our dear Brother-in-Law*

***Moishe Berman***

*on this great milestone. May  
you & Brachie go מחיל אל חיל  
and be a source of Nachas to  
the entire כלל ישראל.*

*Eitan & Yocheved Mayo*



לכבוד

*Rabbi Mordechai  
Eisenberg*

*With utmost appreciation for  
your dedication to us and all  
your Talmidim.*

*Your devotion and dedica-  
tion is unparalleled.*

*Yonah & Shainy Scheiner*



*In honor of my wife*

***Elisheva*** 'שתתי'

*a true אשת חיל. Without  
your encouragement  
and tremendous daily  
מסירת נפש I could not be  
close to where I am  
today.*

*May ה' give you the  
strength and the סיעתא  
לדשמיא to help us realize all  
of our goals.*

*Eli*



*In honor of*

**The ראשי כולל**

*Thank you for all that you taught  
me.*

*A special thank you to the  
Rebbetzins for all the work behind  
the scenes.*

*Rabbi Aharon & Ranana Leeder*

*To our beloved*

**Eli and Sheva Schecter**

*we are so proud of all your shteiging and  
accomplishments.*

*May Hashem continue to give you ברכה to  
continue giving Him and us נזת.*

*Love,*

*Mommy, Daddy, Reuven Yoseph, Shaya,  
Ahuva, and Moish*

הג הסמיכה תשע"ח



*In honor of my grandson*

**Aharon Leeder**

*wishing you Mazal Tov and Kol Tuv.*

*What a wonderful road you have travelled so  
brilliantly and tirelessly. May your future  
hold whatever good things you have worked  
so hard for.*

*Mazal Tov to Ranana and children, and the  
entire Leeder family.*

*Grandma*

*In honor of*

**Rabbi Eli Schecter**

*Rabbi & Mrs. Dovid Merling*



*To our esteemed brother-in-law,  
cousin, and neighbor*

**Rabbi Moshe Eisenberg שליט"א**

*Mazal tov upon this great  
accomplishment  
May you go מחיל אל חיל*

*Sincerely,  
Sholom Dovid & Mindy Freidman*

*In honor of our Chashuva Grandson and Nephew*

**הרב שמואל יצחק הכהן כ"ץ שליט"א**

*upon this momentous occasion.*

*May you be בתורה וביראת to continue shteiging  
שמים bringing רוח נחת רוח הקב"ה together with your  
devoted wife*

**Esther Mina**

*and adorable children קע"ה.*

*תלכו מחיל אל חיל, ברכה והצלחה בכל מעשה ידך*

*With much love,*

*Bobby Krausz*

*Your Uncles and Aunts,*

*Chaim and Shaindy Laufer and Family*

*Chaim and Yides Krausz and Family*

**הג הסמיכה תשע"ח**



*מזל טוב to the esteemed*

**Rabbi & Rebbetzin Berman**

*We are so proud of your  
accomplishments.*

*May you continue to do great things  
for כלל ישראל.*

*From your favorite family in St. Louis,  
Chanan & Shira Swidler*

*In honor of*

**הרב שמואל כ"ץ שליט"א**

*Mazel Tov on  
reaching this  
milestone. May you  
continue to go מחיל  
אל חיל.*

*Mordy & Rusi Katz*

לכבוד אחינו המוסמך החשוב  
האי גברא רבה בר ש"ס  
ופוסקים

**הרב ר' משה דוד ברמן  
שליט"א**

מזל טוב על השמחה הכבירה  
של קבלת הסמיכה!

יה"ר שתמשיך לעלות בהצלחה  
תמיד

בהוקרה רבה  
אלי משה ואיטא ינובסקי

מזל טוב לאברך החשוב

**הרב שמואל יצחק  
הכהן כ"ץ שליט"א**

יהי רצון שתלך מחיל  
אל חיל בסעייתא דשמיא

גיסך ואחותך  
אליעזר אהרון ומשפ'

*In honor of*

**Rabbi Shmuel Katz  
Shlit"א**

*Mazel Tov on this  
great  
accomplishment.  
May you be זוכה to  
many more.*

*Sholom Yehuda  
& Chavie Katz*

לכבוד אחינו היקר שיראתו  
קודמת לחכמתו ומשנתו סדורה

**מוהר"ר שמואל יצחק הכהן  
כ"ץ שליט"א**

תענוג רוחני הוא לנו לשמוח  
אתך בשמחת קבלת סמיכת  
חכמים והיתר הוראה.

יה"ר שיוזכה להפיץ מעיינותיך  
המרובים חוצה ולעמוד  
במשמרת הקודש להורות  
להעם את הדרך ילכו בה ואת  
המעשה אשר יעשון.

באהבה,

דוד ומרים כ"ץ

*A well-deserved  
Mazal Tov to a truly  
accomplished  
group of Talmidei  
Chachomim*

*Rabbi Avi & Gita  
Shafran*

ברגשי גיל כבוד והערכה משגרים  
אנו ברכת מזל טוב לאחינו החשוב

**שמואל יצחק הכהן כ"ץ שליט"א**

על אשר לאחר עמל ויגיעה רבה  
נתעטר בעטרה הנאה וראוי לו  
להתמנות בין מרביצי תורה ומורי  
הוראה לבני א-ל חי.

יהא רעווא שירבה השי"ת גבולך  
להשפיע ולקרב לבבות ישראל  
לאבינו שבשמים, להגדיל תורה  
ולהאדירה מתוך מנוחת הנפש  
והרחבת הדעת עד ביאת גו"צ  
בב"א

שלמה יהודה הכהן קאהן ומשפחתו

לכבוד אחינו היקר  
והחשוב

**כמר ר' שמואל הכהן  
כ"ץ שליט"א**

יה"ר שתמשיך לעלות  
מעלה ומעלה מחיל אל  
חיל בתורה ויר"ש מתוך  
מנוחה והרחוה לאורך  
ימים ושנים!

באהבה

שלומי וחני פאלדער

ברכותנו שלוחה לכבוד אחינו  
היקר  
הרב שמואל יצחק הכהן כ"ץ  
שליט"א  
ולעזרתו  
א. מ. שתח"י  
לרגל חגיגת חג הסמיכה

יהי רצון שתזכה להמשיך  
עבודתכם הקדושה ביתר שאת  
וביתר עז ולראות רוב נחת  
דקדושה מיוצא חלציכם בבריות  
גופא ובנהורא מעליא מתוך  
הרחבת הדעת ומנוחת הנפש.

השמיחים בשמחתכם,  
ארי לייב ואסתי ווייטמאן

ברוב עונג ונחת  
משתתפים אנו בשמחת אחינו  
היקר  
הרב שמואל יצחק הכהן  
כ"ץ שליט"א

שזכה הברכה עמל ויגיעה  
ובהתמדה נפלאה לקבל סמיכה  
להוראה

יה"ר שיזכה למהשיך לעלות  
מעלה ומעלה ביחד עם רעייתו  
החשובה

שלמה כ"ץ וב"ב

To our esteemed  
brother  
**Shmuly**  
Mazel Tov on your major  
accomplishments. May  
you be zoche to go מחיל  
עבודת in your אל חיל  
and be a source of הקדש  
nachas to הקב"ה, your  
parents and all of כ"י.  
You should be זוכה to  
what חז"ל say חז"ל  
תצא חז"ל  
הוראה.

Yossi and Rochel

Mazel Tov to  
our dear brother

הרב משה דוד  
שליט"א

We are so proud!

Yitzy & Haddasa  
Lazar

אחינו אם חכם לבך ישמח  
לבנו גם אנו. אנו שמחים  
וגאים בהשגיו התורניים  
של אחינו

**הרב יוסף דוד שטרן  
שליט"א**

כל מן דין סמוכו לנו

*Your Konigsberg,  
Levovitz, Grunhaus,  
and Shulman siblings*

לכבוד אחינו היקר  
הר"ר שמואל יצחק הכהן

מזל טוב מזל טוב  
יהי רצון שתזכה לילך מחיל  
אל חיל

ולהמשיך בעבודתו הקודש  
יחד עם בני ביתך  
אמן כן יהי רצון

אברמי ומלכי ומשפחתו



We proudly present a collection of Halachic essays written by members of the Kollel. These articles were originally published in the Kollel's weekly email, Points to Ponder. They show clearly the tremendous gains achieved by each member of the Kollel. After spending two years learning בשר בהלב from the סוגיות through הלכה למעשה, the yungeleit possess the knowledge to fully understand not only the הלכה but the reasoning behind it as well. This allows them to properly apply the הלכה gained in practical situations, as is evidenced in these articles.

It has been my honor and privilege to be the initiator of the Points to Ponder project. I am grateful for the assistance of R' Moshe Eisenberg whose amazing talent helped turn this idea into a functioning reality. I would like to personally thank him and all those individuals who have written for and edited this weekly. In addition I would like to thank Rabbi Eisenberg, Rabbi Goldstein and Rabbi Beren for making it all possible and for all their encouragement, advice, and participation.

*Yonah A. Scheiner*



## Rabbi Eliezer Schecter

**Question:** I cooked spaghetti in a fleishig pot for tonight's supper of meatballs and spaghetti. I have some spaghetti left over. May I serve the spaghetti with cheese for tomorrow night's supper?

**Answer:** The גמרא [a] permits hot fish which was placed on a fleishig dish to be eaten with milchigs. The reason given is that since the fish only absorbed secondary flavor (i.e. meat flavor that was transferred to the dish and only then into the fish) the meat flavor is not strong enough to create the prohibition of בשר when combined with milk. This concept is called נ"ט בר נ"ט.

There is a מחלוקת as to where the היתר of נ"ט בר נ"ט pertains; the ריב"ן [b] understands that נ"ט בר נ"ט is permitted only if the fish was *placed* on the meat plate. If however the fish were to be *cooked* on the meat dish, the meat flavor in the fish would still be considered primary flavor. Other ראשונים [c] disagree and are of the opinion that the היתר of נ"ט בר נ"ט would apply even to pareve food *cooked* in a fleishig pot.

The רמ"א [d] writes to be stringent לכתחלה in accordance with the ריב"ן, therefore the היתר of נ"ט בר נ"ט would not apply to the spaghetti, and one should not add cheese to it.

However, the רמ"א adds that if the pot was an אינו בן יומו, i.e. it had not been used for meat in the past 24 hours, we are lenient. Although we are generally stringent לכתחלה with an אינו בן יומו, here we can rely on those who disagree with the ריב"ן and understand that the היתר of נ"ט בר נ"ט applies on pareve food that was cooked in a meat pot as well.

[a] חולין דף קיא

[b] הובא בתוס' שם ד"ה הלכתה

[c] תוס' בשם לשון אחר ברש"י ועוד ראשונים

[d] שו"ע סי' צ"ה סעיף ב'

## Rabbi Eliyahu Silver

**Question:** Is it permitted at the end of a wedding immediately after a meat course to place pitchers of non-dairy coffee creamer on the tables? Likewise may one serve non-dairy ice cream for dessert?

**Answer:** Being that there is no actual milk involved the only question here is one of מראית עין, doing a permissible act which may appear to be prohibited. Since it is difficult to differentiate visually between dairy and non-dairy products it may appear as if one failed to wait the customary period between meat and milk.

However the above particular scenarios would be permitted and do not fall under the category of מראית עין for two reasons:

Firstly, ה"ל only instituted מראית עין concerning the prohibition of eating milk and meat together not regarding the custom to wait after eating meat. Therefore it would be permitted to serve non-dairy products after the meat meal is served although it is still within the waiting period.

Secondly, the issue of מראית עין applies only when the activity looks suspicious to onlookers causing them to suspect that a prohibition was violated. Nowadays there is an abundance of non-dairy creamers and ice cream products available to the consumer. As a result it has become commonplace and accepted to use non-dairy items in place of dairy. An observer observing one eating a dairy-looking product at a time when doing so would be forbidden would assume it is a non-dairy alternative. Therefore serving such products would not arouse suspicion, and would be permitted.

## Rabbi Ahron Leeder

**Question:** May I place a hot meat pot on a dairy counter?

**Answer:** One may not place a hot meat pot on a counter which has traces of dairy on it. If the counter is clean but wet one should also refrain from doing so.

If the counter is clean and dry; the רמ"א [a] states that בליעות (absorbed particles) do not travel from one (non-food) object to another without an intervening liquid. Therefore the dairy בליעות in the counter cannot enter the pot. Although there are those [b] who are stringent [לכתחילה] that בליעות can in fact travel from one utensil to another without liquid, and placing the pot on the dairy counter could potentially be problematic, nevertheless since a counter normally hasn't absorbed dairy within 24 hours, it would not be assur.

That said, the יד אברהם [c] writes that "ישראל" are a holy people, and their custom is to have separate surfaces, one for dairy and one for meat." This custom is still extant today, as we too have separate counters for meat and dairy.

Therefore, as a general rule one should refrain from placing meat pots on a dairy counter. If needed however, although one should not accustom oneself to doing so, one may place a hot meat pot on a dairy counter provided the counter is clean and dry.

[a] יורה דעה צב:ח וצג:א

[b] פשטות הרמ"א צב:ח מיהו עיין אגרות משה יורה דעה ג' סימן י' שהוא מפרש כוונת הרמ"א בענין אחר

[c] יורה דעה פח:א

## Rabbi Eliezer Schecter

**Question:** While cooking meat on the stovetop I realized that there were milk utensils hanging overhead. Do I now need to kasher the milk utensils?

**Answer:** The תשובת הרא"ש quotes the שלחן ערוך which discusses a pot of milk cooking on a fire with a pot of meat directly above it. The רא"ש ruled in that case that the meat is prohibited because of the זיעה-steam which travels upward from the milk to the meat.

The רמ"א adds that this applies only if the milk steam is יד סולדת בו when it reaches the meat; if the steam is no longer יד סולדת בו then the meat is permitted. In fact the רמ"א writes that there were those who were accustomed to hang meat above a fire despite milk cooking underneath. The רמ"א rules that this practice is permitted for the above-mentioned reason, since it was far enough away from the fire that any condensation reaching the meat would no longer be יד סולדת בו. Likewise one would be permitted to hang milk utensils above the stove provided that the זיעה would not be יד סולדת בו when it reaches the utensils.

Any condensation however, must be washed off the pot with cold water before the pot is used again. Therefore if it is likely that there will be cold condensation on the utensils one should not hang them there לכתחלה because one may forget to wash them off before use. Only dirty utensils or raw meat, things that are ordinarily washed prior to use, may be hung over the stovetop in such a scenario, provided as before that the steam is no longer יד סולדת בו.

## Rabbi Shmuel Katz

**Question:** If I warm up challah by placing it on top of the pot of cholent, will it become fleishig?

**Answer:** There are three opinions regarding the status of such challah:

- 1) It is fleishig to the point that it is "fleishig bread" and may not be eaten at all [a].
- 2) It is fleishig, yet may still be eaten since it became fleishig only after the baking process [b].
- 3) It has the same status as if it had been cooked in a fleishig pot. According to this opinion it is not fleishig, although you may not eat it with dairy [c].

Although we generally follow the first opinion, this issue is easily solvable. The simple solution is to place parchment paper or foil between the challah and the pot. The meat flavor will not travel from the pot to the foil without a liquid medium [d]. (If there is steam escaping and hitting the foil, one would need to use a second piece of foil on top of the first to create the dry כלי לכלי barrier.) If one does so, the challah would remain pareve.

If one did not create a dry כלי לכלי barrier, there may still be good reason to allow one to eat this fleishig bread. This is based on the fact that חז"ל only prohibited one from eating fleishig bread if it was made in a large quantity; a small amount that will be eaten within a day does not fall under this גזירה. This is because the bread will not be left around to be mistakenly eaten with dairy. Therefore, if one intends on using the entire challah for the fleishig meal, it would be מותר לכתחילה to place it directly on the cholent pot [e].

One more consideration is can this challah now be eaten with fish?

If steam from the cholent was directly absorbed into the challah,

then one cannot eat it with fish. If there was just one barrier then one may eat it with fish even according to the first two opinions. This is because when dealing with סכנה we aren't concerned about meat flavor, provided there is no actual meat [f]. Here, the כלי filtered out the meat and only let the flavor through.

[a] חוו"ד יו"ד סי' צ"ז סק"ה

[b] ערוך השלחן שם סי' צ"ה סעיף ד' וסימן צ"ז סעיף ט'

[c] פמ"ג סי' צ"ז משב"ז סק"ב

[d] ש"ך סי' ק"ה סקכ"ב

[e] רמ"א סי' צ"ז סעיף א'

[f] שו"ת האלף לך שלמה או"ח שיי"ב ושי"ג

## Rabbi Yonah Scheiner

**Question:** After having eaten milchig, do I need to wait at all prior to eating fleishig?

**Answer:** The גמרא [a] says that after eating meat one must wait before eating cheese, but after cheese it is not necessary to wait before eating meat. However one must do קינוח והדחה – cleaning and rinsing. This is done by eating something pareve which cleans the mouth, and drinking which rinses the mouth. This may be done in any order. One should also wash their hands even if they appear to be clean [b].

Therefore, as a rule one does not need to wait at all before eating meat. The only exception to this rule is hard cheese, i.e. cheese aged six months, which necessitates the same waiting period as meat [c].

The זוהר [d] however, writes that one should be careful not to eat milk and meat in one meal or within one hour.

Many people have the custom to wait up to half an hour before eating meat. There are two possible explanations for this:

1) It is a modified interpretation of the זוהר; the word שעתא חדא – one hour can be interpreted not as a literal hour, rather as a period of time [e].

2) It is just a way of getting around the obligation of cleaning and rinsing. By waiting a bit it is no longer necessary to eat and drink before eating fleishig [f].

If one who is accustomed to waiting before eating meat wishes to change his custom, according to the first reason he may need to be מתיר נדר since it is a מנהג. According to the second reason it is not necessary to be מתיר נדר, for it is a matter of convenience rather than a real מנהג.

Many people have a מנהג that on שבויעות they eat milchig and then fleishig as part of the same meal. Those who do so are clearly

not going with the חומרא of the זהר, and therefore only the second reason above applies. Therefore, if they prefer they may לכתחילה do קינוח והדחה and eat fleishig right away, even if they are generally accustomed to waiting half an hour.

[a] חולין קו

[b] שו"ע יו"ד סי' פט

[c] שם

[d] הובא בש"ך שם סקט"ז

[e] מטה ראובן סי' קפ"ו, שו"ת מהרש"ג ח"א סי' יג

[f] כך שמעתי מהרב משה היינעמאן שליט"א

## Rabbi Eliezer Schecter

**Question:** I ordered a glass of coke at a non-Jewish bar, and the glass came with a slice of lemon on it for flavor. May I consume the lemon or the beverage?

**Answer:** The שולחן ערוך rules [a] that a radish cut with a meat knife will become fleishig, even if the knife had not been used for meat within the past 24 hours. Whereas we would generally say that בליעות become פגום after this amount of time and cannot make something fleishig, the sharpness of the radish can rejuvenate the בליעות inside the knife, and these בליעות would now make the radish fleishig as if the knife had absorbed the meat that very day [b].

Additionally, although generally בליעות don't transfer from one object to another without heat, the pressure of a cutting knife combined with the sharpness of the radish can cause the בליעות to transfer even without heat [c].

The שלחן ערוך [d] extends this prohibition to other sharp foods, e.g. onions and leeks. However, he then permits barrels of lemon juice and herring that were brought by non-Jews. This is despite the concern that the lemons or herring may have been cut with a non-kosher knife.

The רמ"א [e] explains the reason for this is that since generally large amounts of lemons were cut at once, we can assume that the בליעות from the knife have already become בטל. The ש"ך however, states [f] that this היתר should not be used alone without other factors to permit it.

Accordingly, if one cannot ascertain that the knife in the bar is used exclusively for lemons, we cannot permit the slice of lemon for consumption, because we must assume that there are non-kosher בליעות in the knives which the lemons would absorb.

The beverage however, may still be consumed because the

lemon juice is בטל בששים in the coke[g]. however, is not לכתחילה and one should not request a lemon slice with his coke [h].

[a] שו"ע יו"ד סי' צ"ו סעיף א'

[b] ש"ך שם סק"ו

[c] ש"ך שם סק"א

[d] שו"ע שם סעיף ב'

[e] רמ"א שם סעיף ד'

[f] ש"ך שם סק"כ

[g] ואף דבעלמא איסור שמרגישין טעמו נאסרת אפי' כשיש ס' נגדו, כאן דינו כתבלין  
דאיתא ברמ"א סי' צ"ח סק"ה שאין טעמו אוסר אא"כ הוא אוסר מחמת עצמו כמו ערלה  
וע"ז וכדומה

[h] שו"ע יו"ד סי' צ"ט סעיף ה'

## Rabbi Moshe Dovid Berman

**Question:** I speared a sour pickle with a dairy fork; may I now use this pickle for a deli sandwich?

**Answer:** Although דברים חריפים -“sharp foods” (e.g. onions, radishes etc.) cut with a dairy knife become dairy [a] through דוחקא דסכינא (pressure from the knife) and may not be eaten with meat, in this case it would be permitted. There are two reasons why this is so:

Firstly, a pickle may not qualify as a דבר חריף. Although some do consider pickles to be a דבר חריף, many are of the opinion that they are not [b]. The manner in which commercial pickles are produced is as follows: First they are soaked in a brine of up to 10% salt and left to ferment. After the fermentation process the pickles are washed off. Finally, they are placed in “pickle juice” - a combination of water, vinegar, salt and spices. Now, the “pickle juice” would not make the pickle into a davar charif due to the fact that vinegar is not a davar charif, certainly when it is diluted [c]. It would appear then, that the only step of the above process in which the pickle could attain חריפות status is during the fermentation. Concerning this matter the אחרונים [d] discuss borscht which was made of fermented beets. The consensus seems to be that if it has fermented to the degree that it cannot be eaten alone and unmodified it is a דבר חריף, whereas if it can be eaten as-is it is not a דבר חריף. Pickles then, which can be eaten alone, would not qualify as a דבר חריף.

It should be noted that the ט”ז [e] is stringent regarding borscht even before it had fermented to such a degree. His understanding is that inasmuch as leaving the borscht for longer would eventually preclude it from being eaten alone, it already has this sharpness in it at this earlier stage and it is a דבר חריף. Pickles however, which are always ultimately fit to be eaten alone, should not be a דבר חריף even according to the ט”ז.

Those who are stringent regarding pickles would demur, saying that pickles are indeed comparable to borscht; however, in our case one can certainly be lenient due to a second point, concerning the prerequisite of דוחקא דסכינא:

In order to apply דוחקא דסכינא, pressure from a knife is required in order to transfer the flavor into a דבר חריף. A fork does not provide the same cutting pressure as a knife [f], which is evident from the damage done to the area that is pierced by a fork compared to the area cut with a knife. Although some are stringent to consider a fork like a knife regarding דוחקא דסכינא [g], one may rely on the lenient opinion in this case since a pickle is likely not a דבר חריף.

[a] שייע יו"ד צ"ו

[b] עיין פתחי הלכה

[c] ש"ך ק"ה ב'

[d] פתחי תשובה יו"ד צ"ו ד'

[e] שם

[f] כך שמעתי מהרב ראובן פיינשטיין שליט"א

[g] כך שמעתי מהרב וועבשטר שליט"א בשם הרב טובי גאלדשטיין זצ"ל

## Rabbi Yosef Stern

**Question:** May one eat a burger topped with melted imitation cheese in one's own home?

**Answer:** The שו"ע [a] writes that there is an איסור מראית עיין to eat something that has the appearance of בשר והלב. It would seem then, that it would be אסור to eat an imitation cheeseburger being that it would appear to a bystander that one is eating בשר והלב.

Now regarding the איסור מראית עין, the אחרונים [b] differentiate between doing an action that has the appearance of an איסור דאורייתא and an act which appears to be an איסור מדרבנן. If it seems that an איסור דאורייתא is being violated, it is prohibited even in the privacy of one's home. If the violation is מדרבנן however, it would be permitted in ones home. Therefore it would be entirely permitted for one to eat for instance, a chicken dish made with imitation milk in ones own home being that the combination of chicken and milk is only an איסור מדרבנן [c].

Returning to an imitation cheese burger, it would depend on how it was made. If the "cheese" was placed on the burger while cold, then it would only have the appearance of an איסור מדרבנן since they had not been cooked together and would be permitted in one's home [d]. Conversely, if the burger was cooked or grilled with the "cheese", it would be מראית עין of an איסור דאורייתא and would be אסור even in one's own home.

The only remaining situation would be placing the non-dairy cheese onto the burger when it's hot off the grill. According to many אחרונים something that is a דבר גוש (solid object), even if it was removed from the fire retains the status of כלי ראשון as long as it is still hot, and therefore placing real cheese onto a burger would be בישול מה"ת [e]. However, there are those that maintain that although it has a status of a כלי ראשון it is not considered בישול מה"ת [f] and would therefore not be אסור מה"ת. Being that it is a דבר גוש regarding the status of a דבר גוש as a כלי ראשון, and

even among those who are stringent there is disagreement whether it constitutes בישול מה"ת, one may be lenient concerning איסור מדרבנן which itself is an מראית עיין

[a] יו"ד סי' פז סע' ד

[b] מג"א אור"ח סי' שא ס"ק נו

[c] פתחי תשובה סי' פז ס"ק י

[d] Even though it may look like it was cooked together, the ש"ך (ס"ק ו') is of the opinion that as long as in fact it wasn't cooked together it is considered מראית עיין מדרבנן.

[e] מבואר באור"ה שהובא בט"ז סי' צד ס"ק יד

[f] מנחת יעקב שהובא בהו"ד סי' צד ס"ק טו

## Rabbi Eliyahu Silver

**Question:** Must one have two separate salt shakers, one for meat and one for dairy?

**Answer:** The Rema states that our custom is to set aside one salt container for those eating meat and another for those eating dairy. One would be likely to conclude that this implies that we would be obligated to have two separate salt shakers. However there is a significant difference between our modern-day salt shakers and the “salt container” referred to by the Rema. The salt container of those days was actually a mini-dish which was designated for the use of salt. To salt their food one would either dip his food directly into it, or would pinch some salt with his fingers and sprinkle it into his food. That being said we can understand why the custom was to have separate ones. As a result of dipping the food, or fingers that were handling the food, into the salt residue of the food would be likely to remain in the dish, and as a precaution to prevent this residue from transferring to the opposite food type the custom became to have two salt dishes. This concern obviously does not apply to our modern-day salt shakers being that nothing is ever inserted *into* them rather the removal of the salt is by shaking it *out*. This being the case the custom of the Rema does not apply nowadays and one salt shaker would suffice.

Although, we have concluded, that the technical Halacha would seem that one is not *required* to have separate shakers there are Poskim who recommend that the common practice should be to have separate ones. The reason for this is out of concern that the *outside* of the shaker might come into contact with food residue, which may subsequently be transferred to the other food type. For example a dirty hand touching the shaker or mistakenly touching the tip of the shaker to the food. This is especially applicable with small children.

Aside from the aforementioned Rema there is another argument

that has been made for every kosher kitchen to have two salt shakers. This concern does not pertain to a potential mixture of milk and meat during the meal (as the above concern was), but rather during the cooking process. It is common practice to add salt directly from the shaker into a pot while the pot is cooking on the stove. For example, adding salt to a pot of chicken soup. The issue is that the steam, referred to as *zeiah*, from the soup enters the shaker via the holes rendering some of the salt *fleishig*. It would now be problematic to use that same salt for *milchig*. Due to this concern there are authorities which require two shakers. Other authorities maintain that one may be lenient because while shaking the salt there never is a moment that the holes are empty, rather the outgoing salt blocks the steam from entering the shaker, and even if some of those particles of salt which came into contact with the steam were to fall back into the shaker they would be *batul* in the rest of the salt. An easy way to avoid this issue altogether is to simply shake the desired amount of salt into the palm of one's hand and then proceed to pour it into the pot.

## Rabbi Moshe Orgel

**Question:** May I bake cake or cookies in an oven at the same time there is uncovered meat or chicken baking inside?

**Answer:** The גמרא [a] brings down a ברייתא that says one cannot knead dough with milk, and if one did that dough (and eventual bread) will become אסור to eat. The גמרא says that the reason חז"ל prohibited this bread is because of the possibility that this dough will lead to an עבירה. Since bread is used for both milk and meat, the chance of eating meat with this bread is very likely. Cake, cookies, and pastries will have the same דין as bread in regard to this [b]. Having said this, at first glance this cake should be considered as if it has meat inside it, and it would have to be disposed of.

The גמרא brings an exception to this איסור. One could knead dough with milk as long as one makes it “כעין תורא”, literally like “the eye of an ox.”

רש"י [c] explains this to mean that one made very little dough, only the size of the eye of an ox. רש"י explains that the reason for this is since there is only a very small amount, one would eat it in one sitting, and there won't be any leftovers. The מחבר and רמ"א go with this, and rule that one is allowed to make dairy bread for שבעות, or bread with animal fat smeared on it for שבת, since one is making the bread only for a שבת or יו"ט meal and not planning on having leftover.

The רי"ף [d] however, explains this exception of the גמרא to mean that one shaped the dough like the eye on an ox. He says it would be מותר if one shapes the bread into a form that anyone who wants to eat it will know that this bread is dairy. (An ox or cow is a commonly used indication for a milk item.) Though two explanations are given for the same גמרא, the מחבר goes with both of these explanations, and one could use either one.

The מהרי"ט [e] gives another exception. He maintains that the

whole reason for this הלכה is since bread is used for both milk and meat, the חכמים were concerned that one would eat meat with this dairy bread. This would imply that one may bake a dairy bread that one wouldn't eat with meat. He therefore rules that if one were to make dairy sweet rolls, and usually people don't eat such with meat, one may bake them since we are not concerned one will eat it with meat.

Based on the above-mentioned exceptions, we could now apply it to our case. One option would be to only make the size normal for a meat or Pareve meal, in a way that there wouldn't be any leftovers.

Another option is one could make a סימן or place sign on it, that would indicate to people that this cake is Fleishig. It is important to note though, that this סימן must be put on the cake prior to baking it [f]. Putting on red icing afterward will not work since at the time of baking it was done באיסור. Also a סימן (for example, writing) on the pan before baking will not help, as the סימן must be on the cake itself.

Since it is the norm to eat cake together with milk, we will not have the היתר of the מהרי"ט. However in a case where one wanted to make a dairy cake, one would have this היתר as most people do not eat meat with cake.

[a] פסחים דף לו

ע"ז ט"ז סי' צד ס"ק א' דמאור דלומד דל"ד לחם וה"ה כל שער דברים וע"ז פ"מ [b]  
דמביא הצ"צ וכה"ג דלומד דאסור לערב (עכ"פ רוב) חלב ביין וכ"כ מ"א או"ח תמוז סוף  
ס"ק מא וע"ז בפ"ה ומ"י דחולק וכך פסק הח"ד ונראה דהמנהג הוא לנקל בשאר דברים  
חוץ מפת הבאה בכיסנין וכך שמעתי דיש להחמיר בפ"ה ב בשם ר' ראובן פיינשטיין

[c] שם בפסחים

[d] שם בפסחים דף ח עמוד א בדפי הרי"ף

[e] שו"ת מהרי"ט יח ב

[f] חו"ד סימן צז ס"ק ג

## Rabbi Moshe Eisenberg

**Question:** An assortment of dips typically meant for bread was on my table during the fleishig Shabbos meal. Can I replace them on the table for a pareve Shaleshudis which will be followed by a milchig dessert?

**Answer:** There are multiple points the Poskim discuss concerning food or foodservice items being used for both fleishig and milchig meals: A) Leftover bits of food that had been eaten with fleishig may not be eaten with milchig [a]. B) The מנהג is to use separate salt cellars for fleishig and milchig [b] (in contrast to salt shakers, which are open to issues unrelated to our case [c]). C) It is commendable to clear away all items that had been on the table during a fleishig meal even those that had not been eaten together with actual meat, prior to setting a milchig meal [d]. The same applies in reverse.

All of these issues share a common factor: the concern to varying degrees of probability, that bits of meat may be transferred to the milchig meal via utensils or other food. When considering dishes of bread dips however, one need not assume [e] that the contents had become "a food which had been eaten with fleishig" from meat having been directly dipped into it, thus resolving issue A [f].

Similarly, the practice of having separate dishes of salt to be used for fleishig or for milchig was instituted out of the concern, in the א"ר's words, "that bits of food may remain inside the dish." In our case where the dips are typically used only for pareve bread, any food left inside the dish would be inconsequential.

As for the commendable practice to remove all items from the table between meals of opposite type, this applies only between a fleishig meal and a milchig meal or vice versa [g]. A pareve Shaleshudis however, would not be included in this rule despite

being followed by a milchig dessert; therefore the dips may be served without reservation.

[a] ירושלמי פסחים פרק אלו דברים ה"ד, עיין שו"ע יורה דעה סי' פט' סעיף ד'

[b] רמ"א סי' פח' סעיף ב'

[c] עיין סי' צב' סעיף ז' בידיני זיעה

[d] הגהות אשר"י פרק כל הבשר סי' ז'

[e] קים לן דלא מחזקינן איסורא, לדוגמא ע"י סי' פ"ז פ"ת אות טו' בשם בל"י, סי' צ' בדברי הרמ"א סעיף ב', סי' צ"א בדרכי משה אות ה', סי' צ"ה ביאור הגר"א בדברי הרמ"א סעיף ה', סי' ק"ד או"ה מובא בט"ז סק"ג

[f] כך מדויק מלשון הירושלמי דנקט פת שאכל עם הגבינה, ר"ל דווקא מאכל שנאכל עם הגבינה או הבשר נאסר, לאפוקי כל מאי דהוה על השלחן, דההוא הוי אכן מצוה מן המובחר דהגהות אשר"י

[g] כך נראה ממאי דקרי ליה ההגהות אשר"י מצוה מן המובחר, אלמא לאו חיובא הוא, אלא הנהגה טובה ומצוה מן המובחר. ומאחרי שכן, אין לנו אלא חידושו, שלא להשאיר מסעודה בשרית לסעודה חלבית ממש, משא"כ כאן שהוא סעודת פרווה. ולענין הקנחה שהוא חלבי ממש, הרי מאחר שהונחו שם הסליטים בהיתר ודאי אין צריך להסירם מסעודת פרווה לסעודת חלבי.

## Rabbi Moshe Orgel

**Question:** May I buy something in the grocery that does not have a suitable hechsher, but nothing listed in the ingredients seem likely to be a problem?

**Answer:** Being that there are over 500,000 items under hashgacha, it is generally not difficult to find items that have a proper hashgacha. Eating a food item without knowing that all ingredients are kosher and that it was prepared in accordance with הלכה, could very well lead to eating something that is forbidden even when the listed ingredients seem innocent. Some of the potential issues are as follows:

A) Even though current FDA policy states that all ingredients must be listed clearly on the on the label, it also states “If an ingredient is present at an incidental level and has no functional or technical effect in the finished product, then it need not be declared on the label”. Therefore even though you recognize that all the ingredients listed are kosher, there might be problematic ingredients not listed.

B) Additionally, artificial and natural flavors need not be specified, and are allowed be listed under a general category of flavor, natural flavoring or artificial flavoring. Although most flavoring is kosher there are some problematic flavorings used, and you wouldn't be able to tell from the list of ingredients. Although the general rule is that non-kosher items are batul (nullified) if they are less than a 60<sup>th</sup> of the food product, here since this ingredient is known to give taste (after all, it is the flavoring) it will not be batul, despite its being a minute amount.

It is important to note that even if a trace amount of a non-kosher ingredients, less than 1/60 of the total product, is added, the kosher status would depend on the processing of the product. If a smaller mixture was made first with that trace amount in which the non-kosher ingredient is more then 1/60, that mixture would

become חג"ן. We look like this small mixture is one whole mixture of איסור, and ergo you would need sixty times this smaller mixture to nullify it, and 1/60 of the original non-kosher ingredient would be insufficient.

C) Food is prepared in pots, pans, or on factory equipment. There is no way to know if this equipment was used for non-kosher items within the twenty four hours prior to this product being made. Although there is a rule "סתם כלים אינו בן יומיו", and generally we may assume that a pot or pan was not used within the last 24 hours for an item that will make this food treif, the Gemara excludes בית מורחשת from this rule. The reason for this exclusion is, since such a facility is constantly used, we are required to assume it was used for a problematic food within the prior twenty four hours. Many food factories run constantly around the clock, creating a comparable situation. Not only does this issue apply to the actual food product itself, this also applies to some of the ingredients as well e.g. vegetable oil, which could have been extracted on a factory line that was used for animal oils.

D) There are many other potential problems that have not been listed, such as wine and grape juice, or vinegar, which may contain some wine or grape juice in it, leading to issues of יין נסך. In addition to issues of בישול עכור'ים, הכשר כלים, and much more.

Keeping all of this in mind, since the laws of kashrus are complex, in addition to the complexities of modern food preparation, we are best off trusting the mashgiach and the hashgachah to ensure all items are prepared in accordance with halacha. Therefore, next time you're looking for your favorite candy or chocolate bar, make sure that a hashgacha is printed on the label.

*This edition, Points to Ponder presents varying opinions concerning a common question which is of debate among contemporary פוסקים. As the ערוך השלחן says, תפארת השיר היא כשהקולות משונים זה מזה.*

*For practical guidance, we encourage one to consult their Rov.*

**שאלה:** If one eats French fries from a fleishig restaurant- where the deep fryer is often used for meat or chicken- does one need to wait six hours before eating milk?

### תשובה א'

**Rabbi Moshe Dovid Berman**

In essence one who eats a תבשיל של בשר (loosely translated as "a dish containing meat," e.g. cholent) and does not eat the meat, need not wait six hours, since no actual meat was eaten [a]. However, the רמ"א [b] writes that the accepted מנהג is to wait six hours. The רמ"א qualifies the מנהג that food which had merely been cooked in a fleishig pot without any actual meat does not require one to wait. The ש"ך [c] wonders: based on the concept of נ"ט בר נ"ט, one would be permitted to eat this dish even with dairy directly [d]; if so, what is the רמ"א adding by allowing one to eat dairy immediately after eating such a dish?

Therefore, the ש"ך explains that the רמ"א's intention was to exempt one from this waiting period after having eaten food cooked in a pot containing some meat residue, even when this residue is significant enough to impart flavor into the dish [e]. Such a dish is indeed forbidden to be consumed together with dairy, yet does not require one to wait six hours.

In order to understand this distinction, we need to analyze the reasoning behind the מנהג cited by the רמ"א. The easiest way to understand is as follows: a dish containing meat is equated with meat by many people, potentially leading to confusion with meat proper. This potential for confusion led to the מנהג of regarding a תבשיל של בשר as meat itself, necessitating a six hour wait. Based

on this reasoning, one can understand the qualification of the רמ"א, as explained by the ש"ך, to be teaching that only a dish which could lead to confusion is included in this מנהג. A dish into which a bit of meat was unintentionally included via the dirty pot would not have this potential pitfall, as there was no intention to create a meat dish, and such a dish is not viewed as a meat dish.

Consequently, even if there were to be some meat residue in the deep fryer, there was no intention to produce meat fries, rather only to produce French fries, and any fat or grease that slipped in would be inconsequential. Additionally, the fries are not viewed by the consumer as being meat flavored, rather as pareve.

Although one may argue that if one were to consume the oil itself one would indeed need to wait six hours, it would not however, turn the fries into a תבשיל של בשר. Since the oil itself is not viewed as a food item rather as a method to cook the fries it has the same status as a pot with a bit of grease, as opposed to being a food item which already acquired תבשיל של בשר status [f].

There are some אחרונים [g] who disagree with the ש"ך, and feel that the רמ"א did not intend to exclude a dirty pot, rather to exclude a דבר חריף; however, the prevailing custom is to rely on the רמ"א's understanding of the רמ"א.

In conclusion if one were to eat fries from a fleishig restaurant, without eating any meat, they would not need to wait six hours before eating dairy.

### **תשובה ב'**

**Rabbi Shmuel Katz**

Although the מחבר [a] requires waiting only after eating meat, the רמ"א [b] says the מנהג is not to eat dairy even after eating a תבשיל של בשר. The רמ"א [c] points out, however, that פרוה food which was merely cooked in a fleishig pot would not preclude

one from eating dairy immediately afterward. The obvious question is that food cooked in a fleishig pot may-בדיעבד- be eaten with dairy itself; there should be no need for the רמ"א to mention that after having eaten it there is no need to wait.

The ש"ך [d] famously explains that the רמ"א is talking about where the fleishig pot had not been washed well prior to the פרווה food being cooked inside it. Despite there being some meat residue and flavor in the פרווה food one would not have to wait after eating this food before eating dairy. The ש"ך seems to understand that when the meat flavor is only coincidental the food is not called a תבשיל של בשר; therefore there is no מנהג to wait.

Now while it may be true that the fries in question only coincidentally have a meat flavor, the oil however, tells a different story. The oil was consciously and intentionally cooked together with the meat and chicken that was fried inside it. As such, the oil itself would qualify as a תבשיל של בשר. The fries can now be described as potatoes that were dipped into a בשר של בשר. Therefore if not the potato itself, the oil that's on it will necessitate waiting six hours before eating dairy [e].

Additionally all this begins only if one agrees with the ש"ך's understanding of the רמ"א. רעק"א [f] however, proposes a simpler way to read the רמ"א: the רמ"א is teaching us that one does not need to wait six hours after eating פרווה food that was cooked in a fleishig pot, even if the food were to become fleishig i.e. if one cooked sharp foods. This leaves us with the original understanding of what the רמ"א was referring to when he said the מנהג is to wait, ואין לשנות ולפרוץ גדר; that one needs to wait after eating any food that has טעם from ממשות of meat [g].

In conclusion, if the fries were made in the same deep-fryer as the meat and chicken products, one should wait six hours before eating dairy.

**מראי מקומות לתשובה א'**

[a] ש"ע יו"ד פי"ט ג'

[b] שם

[c] שם

[d] למעשה, דווקא בדיעבד מותר לאכל יחד עם חלב

[e] פתחי תשובה שם

[f] סברא פשוטה, וכן שמעתי מהרב מרדכי איזנברג שליט"א וכעין זה שמעתי מהרב מנחם גאלדמאן שליט"א. וכן הסכים הרב גאלדמאן למעשה שאין צריך לשהות שש שעות לאחר אכילת ציפ"ס הצרפתיים

[g] רעק"א ובית מאיר שם

**מראי מקומות לתשובה ב'**

[a] יו"ד סי' פ"ט סעי' ג'

[b] שם

[c] שם

[d] שם ס"ק י"ט

[e] בפרט שיש שלומד הש"ך רק באופן שאין הממשות נ"ט בהתבשיל (ע' פ"ת ס"ק ז' בשם בל"י)

[f] חידושי רע"ק על הש"ך הנ"ל

[g] וכן קיבלתי ממור"ר י"י לרנר וממור"ר שמואל פורסט שלא להקל כדברי הש"ך

## Rabbi Shmuel Katz

**Question:** I bought a new set of dishes for use with fleishigs. May I designate the mugs that come with the set for use with milchigs?

**Answer:** The רמ"א [a] writes that in order to be able to differentiate the milchig and fleishig knives, the מנהג is to make a mark on the dairy ones. This מנהג was to etch three grooves into the handle [b] of the dairy utensil. The מנהג was universal to the extent that the פמ"ג [c] says that if one were to find a knife with these grooves on the handle on a Jewish street, the knife is definitely milchig.

The דרכי תשובה [d] quotes from the אדני פו that even if the knives have recognizably different handles, one should still make three grooves in the milchig handle. He understands that it is proper to make a universally recognizable sign, so others using your knives will also be able to tell the difference. The ערוך השלחן [e] on the other hand suggests having visibly different sets of dishes for milchig and fleishig to avoid confusion, even if it's not a universally recognizable design. He seems to understand that we are only concerned that the owner and his family know which is which.

The general custom today is to follow the opinion of the ערוך השלחן. This is evident from the fact that we are not careful to have dishes that are universally recognizable as milchig or fleishig. In fact many have never heard of הריצי חלב, the three grooves which were ubiquitous once upon a time. However even the ערוך השלחן [f] agrees that if there is a universal way of designating dishes one should not do the opposite, i.e. one should not use three grooves as his personal way of labeling his fleishig dishes. Consequently one may not use and label dishes in a way that will confuse others, even if the owner and the owner's family are aware of this. In our case it is almost universal that all the matching dishes from a set are used

together as a set, and splitting them may lead others to use them improperly.

Therefore in conclusion, if one wishes to split a set of dishes one should label the mugs as dairy in a way that even an outsider who knows that the rest of the set is fleishig will realize that the mugs are not to be used with the set, as they have been separated to be used with milchigs.

[a] יו"ד סי' פ"ט סעי' ד'

[b] תשו' אדני פז, השמטות דף ל"ט

[c] יו"ד שם

[d] יו"ד סי' פ"ט ס"ק נ"ד

[e] יו"ד סי' פ"ט סעי' ט"ז

[f] שם

## Rabbi Eliezer Schecter

**Question:** There is no prohibition on Shabbos when heating something that was already cooked [a]. This concept is known as אין בישול אחר בישול. Is אין בישול אחר בישול said in regard to the prohibition of cooking meat and milk together? For example, would one be allowed to reheat a prepackaged meal of cooked food that belongs to his non-Jewish worker?

**Answer:** רבי עקיבא איגר [b] rules that the prohibition of cooking meat and milk together is only if it is being cooked for the first time. If the meat and milk were cooked previously we say אין בישול אחר בישול, and there is no prohibition to cook it a second time.

The כריתתו ופליתי [c] argues to the contrary based on the גמרא in חולין [d]. The גמרא states that one may not place a meat dish on a table that has a milk dish on it or vice versa, because we are concerned that one might bring a hot dish to the table and cause the meat and milk dishes to be cooked together. It would seem that although the two dishes are already cooked, there would still be a prohibition of cooking meat and milk when cooking them together.

The פרי מגדים [e] differentiates between the case in גמרא, and the general concept of אין בישול אחר בישול as it applies to cooking meat and milk together. The גמרא is discussing meat and milk that although they were previously cooked they were never cooked together as one. In that case the concern would be that the dishes would mix, causing milk and meat to be cooked together for the first time. If however the meat and milk had been cooked together once before and the product of cooked meat and milk had already been created it would then be permitted to heat it a second time as we say אין בישול אחר בישול.

This differentiation answers a question the זוטא asks on the שער אפרים [f]. The שער אפרים rules that butter that was cooked in

a fleishig utensil may not be used as גר חנוכה, because even the benefit derived from the cooked meat and milk is prohibited. He explains that this is despite the fact that we generally do not consider a pleasure derived from the observance of a mitzvah to be a benefit.

The זוטא asks why are we only concerned about deriving benefit, what about the prohibition of cooking meat and milk together? Why is it not simply prohibited to light the butter because of the prohibition of cooking meat and milk together? According to פרי מגדים there is no question [g]. Although one may not cook milk and meat together even if they were both individually cooked before, one may however cook them if they have already been cooked together because we say אין בישול אחר בישול.

In conclusion, one may rely on the פרי מגדים and it would be permitted to reheat a meat and milk mixture that had been previously cooked together before. However, if there are a few different food items being warmed, one should ensure that there is no milk product in the prepackaged meal that had not been cooked with the rest of the dish previously.

[a] ע"י טור או"ח סי' שיה סעיף ד'

[b] יו"ד סי' פז סעיף א'

[c] פליתי סי' פז על הרמ"א סעיף ו'

[d] דף קד:

[e] פ"מ סי' ק"ה משב"ז סק"ב

[f] מובא בפ"ת סי' פז סק"ד ובפמ"ג שם ש"ד סק"ב ועיי"ש משכ' בזה

[g] הגהות רעק"א על הפמ"ג שם

## Rabbi Yonah Scheiner

**Question:** I am not sure if six hours have passed since I ate fleishigs, do I need to wait until I'm absolutely certain that six hours has passed before eating milchigs?

**Answer:** The general rule regarding uncertainty in halacha is ספק דאורייתא לחומרא, וספק דרבנן לקולא [a]. That if the matter in question is מן התורה we are stringent while if it's דרבנן we are lenient. If we were to apply this rule in our scenario one can be lenient and eat the milchigs, since the obligation to wait between eating meat and milk is דרבנן. There is however a catch. That is that we are not allowed to be lenient even by ספק דרבנן when the prohibition in question is subject to eventual removal or expiration. This is called a דבר שיש לו מתירין [b]. [c] רש"י explains with the following reasoning, if you can eat it permissibly why eat when there is a possible prohibition. Maybe then in our case it would be necessary to wait until it certainly six hours when the milchigs can be eaten without relying on the היתר of ספק דרבנן [d]. לקולא [d].

The גודע ביהודה [e] says a phenomenal חידוש based on רש"י's logic that one may not rely on a leniency if they can eventually accomplish their objective without said leniency. This, says the גר"ב, would only apply if we are discussing the permissibility of a one-time use such as eating. If the continued use of the item is in question, such as the permissibility of moving an item that is possibly מוקצה, being lenient and permitting its use would not preclude its usage once again after the time of the prohibition passes. In such a case the Halacha would not dictate that one wait to use it until it becomes מותר, for it is no longer a question of whether to use it now (בספק) or later (בהיתר), rather it's whether it may be used now as well as later. Since it will be of use later either way, we cannot view that eventual use as being a postponement of its current use and being stringent will cause the irreplaceable loss of its current usage.

Based on this, the דרכי תשובה [f] says that waiting six hours to eat milchigs would not be categorized as a מתירין לו. For although the prohibition in question is regarding the permissibility of eating, it is not the food which is inherently limited that is in question, but rather the person's ability to eat it, and there is no limit to how much milchigs a person may eat. Therefore what one forgoes eating now cannot be replaced by eating at a later time, for the question is whether the person should be allowed to do both. We are left then with the standard rule of ספק דרבנן לקולא, and one would be allowed to be lenient. Although many early אחרונים [g] do not make the differentiation of the נודע ביהודה, many פוסקים say that in our case there is what to rely on if one were to be lenient [h].

[a] גמ' ביצה ג:

שם ד. טוש"ע או"ח סי' תקיג סעיף ב', יו"ד סי' ק"ב סעיף א' [b]

רש"י שם ג: ד"ה אפילו באלף לא בטל, ד. ד"ה אפילו בדברנן [c]

יד יהודה סי' פ"ט סק"א [d]

שו"ת נודע ביהודה מהדו"ת אבה"ע סי' לח, או"ח סי' עד, צל"ח פסחים ט: ד"ה [e]  
תשע צבורין

[f] דרכי תשובה סי' פט סק"ה

מג"א סי' שי סק"ח, שו"ך יו"ד סי' קב סק"ח, ועיין בדרכי תשובה שם סקל"ז, [g]  
ושם בפ"ת סק"ו, ועיין שו"ת שמן רוקח ה"ג או"ח סי' לד

[h] דרכי תשובה סי' פט סק"ה, ועיין בדלתי תשובה יו"ד פט אות ב' שכתב כמה טעמים להקל, ועיין בדי השלחן סי' פט בביאורים ד"ה שש שעות שהאריך בזה. וכדאי להעתיק כאן מה שאומרים מפי השמועה בשם הגר"מ פיינשטיין שמה שהאדם חושב שעברו כבר שש שעות סגי ואין צריך ראייה. ואין זה מצד הספק אלא מעיקר דין שש שעות.

## Rabbi Eliezer Schecter

**Question:** Why can't I cook with an ingredient that has a tiny amount of non-kosher in it, being as it would be much less than one sixtieth of my dish in any case?

**Answer:** The Gemara in חולין [a] states that the זרוע of the Nazir's ram offering which was given to the Kohen had a unique Halacha. There is a disagreement among the ראשונים as to what that Halacha is.

The ראב"ד [b] learns that the uniqueness was that the זרוע was cooked with the rest of the meat, even though the flavor of the זרוע- which could only be eaten by a kohen- would be בטל לכתחילה (i.e. intentionally nullified) into the rest of the meat, which was then eaten by a non-kohen. In contrast all other prohibitions cannot be בטל לכתחילה into food that is permissible to eat. Accordingly, the prohibition of לכתחילה not being מבטל a non-kosher food would be דאורייתא, as it is derived from the laws of זרוע בשלה.

The ר"ן [c] and others [d] understand that the unique halacha pertaining to the זרוע is the positive מצוה to cook it despite the flavor of the זרוע becoming בטל into the rest of the meat, in contrast to other איסורים where there is certainly no Mitzva to be מבטל them. Yet we do not derive any prohibition מדאורייתא to do so. Nevertheless, it is prohibited מדרבנן to be מבטל something אסור into something that is permissible. The ראשונים explain that the reason for this rabbinic prohibition is because it is improper to add non-kosher to food which will then be consumed [e].

Most ראשונים and אחרונים [f] follow the opinion of the ר"ן that the prohibition to be מבטל איסור is מדרבנן.

So what is the difference if the prohibition to be מבטל non-kosher into kosher food is דאורייתא or מדרבנן?

According to all opinions non-kosher food which was

deliberately בטל is prohibited by rabbinic penalty to the person who did it. Equally clear is the fact that non-kosher which spilled and became בטל is permitted. One case remains however, which retains aspects of both the above scenarios and is not so simple: non-kosher food which was unintentionally placed into kosher food.

In such a situation, רבי יהודה says that we are קונם שוגג אטו מזיד - the unintentional ביטל is prohibited, so that one does not come to be מבטל non-kosher into kosher intentionally. רבי יוסי says that by rabbinic prohibitions we do not say קונם שוגג אטו מזיד, and therefore there is no prohibition to eat the food. However regarding an איסור דאורייתא we are קונם. The Halacha follows the opinion of רבי יוסי.

[g] רבי עקיבא איגר states that according to the ראב"ד since the prohibition to be מבטל non-kosher food into kosher food is דאורייתא, we would be קונם שוגג אטו מזיד and food that had non-kosher placed in it and became בטל, albeit unintentionally, would be prohibited to consume. According to the ר"ן however, who says that the prohibition to be מבטל is only מדרבנן, we would not be קונם שוגג אטו מזיד and the food would be permissible to consume.

In conclusion: Since we rule [h] that we are not קונם שוגג אטו מזיד, whether the non-kosher food spilled into kosher food or even if it was put into the kosher unintentionally the food may be eaten so long as the non-kosher is בטל. If however, the food was put in intentionally it would be forbidden for the one who put it in to consume the food [i].

[a] חולין דף צה [b] הובא בכל הראשונים שם [c] על הרי"ף דף לה [d] הרשב"א ועוד ראשונים [e] המאירי והרשב"א [f] כן נראה הסכמת הט"ז והש"ך ושאר כל האחרונים [g] על השו"ע יו"ד סי' צ"ט סעיף ה' ובהוות דעת סק"ד [h] שו"ע שם [i] שם

## Rabbi Shmuel Katz

**Question:** Why is it acceptable to eat cholent while there is herring on the table, as well as others at the table eating herring, such as at a kiddush?

**Answer:** It has already been discussed that one may not eat meat at a table with dairy on it, unless one places a היכר as a reminder not to also eat from the dairy. This הלכה applies to any situation where one is prohibited from partaking in the other food.

This that the שו"ע says not to eat meat with fish is not halachic in nature, rather eating meat with fish may cause physical harm [a]. The question is will this require a היכר?

The טור in טור says that his father the רא"ש was accustomed to wash his hands between meat and fish because (חולין י.) – one needs to be more careful with things that are dangerous than with things that are prohibitions. The קהל יהודה [b] extrapolates from this that one should not eat fish at a table which has meat on it; the same way one cannot eat meat at a table with dairy.

Now everyone agrees that one is required to wash their hands after eating dairy before eating meat. However between fish and meat there is a disagreement. The א"ח in טור ומחבר [c] go like the רא"ש that one needs to wash their hands after eating fish before eating milk, however the רמ"א in יו"ד [d] says that today the custom is not to.

The א"ח in א"ח [e] says that it's possible that today there no significant danger in eating fish and meat because the nature of things has changed since the time of חז"ל. The חת"ם סופר [f] says that even though the danger no longer exists, we do not have the power to undo חז"ל's ban on eating meat and fish together. However we no longer need to be stringent in the matter like we generally are when it comes to matters of סכנה. הרב יוסף יצחק לרנר. שמירת הגוף והנפש [g], posits that even the מ"א in his work, שליט"א

himself only meant this as a reason to be lenient in regard to washing hands and not to permit eating meat and fish together.

In conclusion although one may not eat them together, there is no need to have a היכר if you are eating cholent next to someone eating herring [h].

[a] לשונו הוא "צריך ליוזהר ... מפני שקשה לצרעת"

[b] סי' פ"ח

[c] סי' קע"ג סעי' ב'

[d] סי' קט"ז סעי' ג'

[e] שם ס"ק א'

[f] שו"ת חיו"ד ס"ס ק"א

[g] סי' א' סעי' י"ז הערה כ"ט בא"ד "ולולא"

[h] יביע אומר ח"ו חיו"ד ס"ט היתר מטעם הנ"ל וגם היתר השבט הלוי ח"ו סי' קי"א א:ג. א  
וכן היתר רוב הפוסקים מטעמים שונים

## Rabbi Eliezer Schecter

**Question:** May I purchase a product that contains a non-kosher ingredient, if it is less than one-sixtieth of the product?

**Answer:** Kosher food that has a bit of non-kosher in it will remain kosher provided that the איסור is less than one-sixtieth of the היתר, since the איסור becomes בטל. The Shulchan Aruch [a] however, rules that one may not be מבטל איסור intentionally. Furthermore, one who was מבטל איסור intentionally is penalized and may not eat the mixture. The שולחן ערוך adds that even if someone else did it for him, he may not consume the food.

The ריב"ש [b] writes that one who was intentionally מבטל איסור into food available for purchase by others, it is as if he was מבטל the איסור specifically for the one who subsequently purchased the food. As such, the food is prohibited to the purchaser.

According to this it would seem that one may not purchase anything that has even the tiniest amount of non-kosher. Because it is considered בטל specifically for him, and as we said something that was בטל for an individual may not be eaten by that individual.

However the רדב"ז [c] understands that ביטול done by a non-Jew is different. He explains that even if a non-Jew were to be מבטל איסור for an individual that food may be eaten, unless the non-Jew was specifically instructed to be מבטל the איסור. Only in such a case is it as if the Jew was מבטל the איסור himself.

Accordingly, if one purchases a product from a non-Jewish manufacturer he would be able to eat it even if the product contains איסור that was בטל into it.

What's the difference? Why would the איסור that was בטל by a non-Jew who was מבטל intentionally for the benefit of a Jew be better than if it was a Jew who was מבטל the איסור for another Jew?

The difference is that if a Jew was מבטל the איסור he performed a forbidden act, therefore we penalize the resulting mixture created by that forbidden act. If however it was a non-Jew who was מבטל it for the Jew without being instructed to do so, there was no forbidden act done. Accordingly, there is no reason to penalize the action of ביטול, unless the non-Jew was specifically instructed to do so, in which case it is as if the Jew did it himself [d]. Indeed the רמ"א [e] and most פוסקים [f] agree that one may purchase a product that relies on the ביטול of a non-Jew.

If this is true, then there is seemingly no issue with buying a product made by a non-Jewish manufacturer that has איסור that was בטל in it. If so why do most kashrus organizations refuse to give a hechsher on products that rely on ביטול? There are several reasons why they may be hesitant to give a hechsher on a product that relies on ביטול: A) Some say [g] that giving a hechsher would be akin to asking the non-Jew directly to be מבטל איסור for us, which everyone agrees is like doing it ourselves. B) The דרכי תשובה [h] and אמרי בינה [i] bring some שיטות that disagree with the רמ"א, and say that purchasing something that had ביטול constitutes an act of איסור ביטול. C) Additionally, Rav Moshe Feinstein [j] maintains that it is improper to give a hechsher on a product that has איסור that is בטל in it even though it technically permitted to do so.

[a] שו"ע יו"ד סי' צ"ט סעיף ה'

[b] תשו' סי' תצ"ה

[c] סי' תתקע"ח

[d] כדאיתא באגרות משה יו"ד ח"ב סי' מ"א

[e] סי' קי"ד סעיף ו'

[f] מהר"ם לובלין וחת"ס הובאו באמרי בינה יו"ד סי' י"ב ובדרכי תשו' יו"ד סי' ק"ח סק"כ

[g] בדי השולחן סי' צ"ט סעיף ה' בביאורים

[h] שם

[i] שם

[j] שם

## Rabbi Ahron Leeder

**Question:** May I drink from a water bottle used during a dairy meal if I am now eating meat?

**Answer:** The Gemara [a] says one may not eat dairy on the same table as one eating meat if they are familiar with each other. This is because they may come to taste from each other's food. The Gemara explains that this only applies if they are eating in one "תפיסה" (lit. bundle), group. Tosfos explains that placing a היכר (something on the table that will remind them not to eat from each other) between them, thereby separating the group, permits them to eat on the same table. Eating on two separate tables next to each other is also permitted as there is no group altogether.

The איסור והיתר [b] rules that even if there is a היכר between them they should not drink from the same cup, because this may cause them to eat from each other's food negating the effect of the היכר. He adds that even when they are eating on separate tables and a היכר is unnecessary, it is good to refrain from drinking from the same cup. Although we are not worried that they will come to eat from each other's portions, there is another problem when one eats, most times grease from the food one is eating gets stuck to the cup. If they share the same cup they will swallow the residue of each other's food.

The Rema [c] rules that when eating together, even in a permitted way, they should be careful not to drink from the same cup because of the food which gets stuck to the cup. The Shach [d] explains that this is even if they are not familiar with each other and even on two separate tables.

One should not argue that the גזירה was only said when there are two people eating simultaneously and not when using the same cup from meal to meal because the entire concern was that there would be residue on the cup. Additionally, we find that the Aruch Hashulchan [e] writes that most have the מנהג to remove

all food and utensils from the table between dairy and meat meals. This would surely include a water bottle that is likely to have food residue on it.

In conclusion, when one uses a cup or water bottle by a meal there will likely be residue stuck to it. Therefore one should be careful not to use it during a dairy meal and then again at a meat meal without first wiping it off.

[a] חולין קז:

[b] כלל מ' דין י"ד

[c] יו"ד סי' פ"ח סעיף ב'

[d] שם סק"ח

[e] סי' פ"ט סעיף ט"ו

## Rabbi Moshe Dovid Berman

**Question:** If one is eating meat and someone he is acquainted with sits down next to him eating dairy, is there any way to inconspicuously create a היכר? Overtly creating a היכר may offend the other individual by highlighting his unfamiliarity with this Halacha.

**Answer:** The Gemara [a], when introducing the איסור of two individuals eating opposite מיינים, limits the prohibition to a scenario when eating בתפיסה אחת, in “one bundle” i.e. one group. In addition to the requirement for the two individuals to be acquainted with each other, the individuals eating on the table together need to be eating in a situation of תפיסה אחת. Tosofos [b] and many Rishonim [c] explain that placing a היכר permits the two parties to eat together, serving as a reminder not to eat from one another. Another idea mentioned to avoid the prohibition of eating on the same table is using a separate table cloth.

It would seem that the idea of a היכר is different from eating on two tables. Eating on two tables is not meant serve as a reminder, they simply are not eating together. מין הז"ל never forbade being in proximity to someone eating the other מין, they forbade eating with someone eating the other מין. A היכר on the other hand, is meant to remind two people who *are* eating together not to share their food, thereby separating them. The היכר doesn't physically separate those eating together, rather reminds them not to eat something forbidden. One simple practical difference between the two concepts is do they need to be aware of this situation. If one is using a היכר both parties would need to be aware of the היכר, otherwise it serves no purpose. Additionally, the Achronim [d] write that the object serving as the היכר needs to have some substance to it, in order that it should be noticed by those eating. Whereas if they are on separate tables there is no need to explicitly have intention to be separate, they are intrinsically separate. For example, two individuals sitting next to each other

on an airplane may eat from their individual trays, even though there is nothing unique that would serve as a reminder.

The question here is, eating on a separate table cloth, is that a היכר, or does it create a situation in which the two eaters are not eating together as if on two tables? It is possible to be מדייק from Tosafos [e] that it is not in the category of היכר, rather breaks up the group. In addition, we don't find [f] any requirement that the two tablecloths need to be in any way unusual or different than normal, implying that it is an intrinsic separation not merely a היכר. Nor is there a requirement for the tablecloth to have any substance or height. However from the Shulchan Aruch [g] it would seem that it may be working as a היכר, as the מחבר combines these two exceptions; two tablecloths and היכר. However the opinion of the מחבר is unclear, because in the בית יוסף in אורח חיים [h] he implies that they are two separate things. When bringing the laws of היכר regarding Niddah [i] though, his wording seems to indicate that both operate as reminders.

If we were to understand that two tablecloths serve as an intrinsic separation we have a solution to our dilemma. All one would need to do would be place a napkin or some other object under his plate, thereby raising his plate above the table, creating a situation in which the two of them are no longer eating together. The other person would not even need to be aware of this, as explained since it is not meant to serve as a reminder.

However, since this matter unclear and a discussion amongst the contemporary Poskim [j], one should consult a qualified rabbi regarding how to proceed.

[a] חולין קז: שם [b] שם [c] רא"ש על אתר [d] ט"ז יו"ד פ"ה [e] חולין שם [f] לא מצאתי [g] יו"ד פ"ה וגם יו"ד קצ"ה [h] קע"ג [i] יו"ד ס"ו קצ"ה [j] שמעתי מהרה"ג ר' ראובן פיינשטיין שליט"א שיש להקל בזה אבל כמה פוסקים מחמירים

## Rabbi Ahron Leeder

**Question:** Is there a problem with putting a hot pot of chicken soup on to my refrigerator shelf?

**Answer:** The first concern would be that there may be residue of something dairy on the shelf (i.e. cheese or spilled milk) as it is common to find residue on refrigerator shelves. Putting a hot (110°) pot of chicken soup which was on the fire on top of dairy residue will cause the heat of the pot to cook the dairy residue together with the blios (absorbed taste) of chicken which is in the pot [a]. Even if the pot is not hot, if it is known that there is dairy residue on the shelf one would need to wash off the bottom of the pot before putting it back on the fire.

If the shelf is clean and dry; we paskin that blios are unable travel from one utensil to another without liquid in between [b], therefore even if there are dairy blios in the shelf they cannot enter the pot. Even according to those who say that one should be stringent [c] [לכתחילה] that blios can travel from one utensil to another without liquid in between, here the shelf normally hasn't absorbed dairy within the past 24 hours, and therefore would not be problematic.

Another concern that may [d] apply is that the Rema [e] says that it is good to be machmir like those who are concerned that one should not store in one box a container of meat near a container of milk. The Shach points out that this would only apply if the containers were uncovered.

In conclusion, one may put a hot pot of chicken soup on a clean shelf of a refrigerator . If the shelf has residue on it one should put something (i.e. a towel) on the shelf before putting in the pot. It may be preferable to cover the pot or any other dairy product in the refrigerator.

Please note: On Shabbos, one should be careful not to put a hot pot on top of uncooked residue or water.

להפרי חדש הוה בישול דאורייתא ולכו"ע הוה בשר חלב בהקליפה התחתון [a]

רמ"א יורה דעה סי' צ"ב סעיף ח', סי' צ"ג סעיף א' [b]

פשטות הרמ"א צב-ח אבל האיגרות משה יורה דעה ג סימן י לומד הרמ"א בענין אחר [c]

[d] A refrigerator may not be considered a תיבה. Also, the פרי טוהר is מחלק between leaving for a short time versus putting it in a box for storage.

סי' צ"ה סעיף ו' [e]

## Rabbi Shmuel Katz

**Question:** I am cooking for a large meat meal and I am out of meat pots; may I use a clean dairy pot to cook pasta for the meal?

**Answer:** Pareve food cooked in a dairy pot has a secondary dairy flavor called נ"ט בר נ"ט. The רמ"א [a] says that לכתחלה one cannot eat this food with meat [b]. However if the pot was an אינו בן יומו, one can לכתחלה eat the pareve food with meat [c]. The question is; can one cook pasta in an אינו בן יומו dairy pot for the express purpose of eating the pasta with meat?

Today we do not use לכתחלה a pot that is אב"י in a way that it wouldn't be used if it was בן יומו, therefore some say [d] that one may not eat pasta cooked in an אב"י dairy pot with meat. However the גר"א [e] explains that the reason we don't use an אינו בן יומו pot is because there is the חשש that one may come to use it while it's still a בן יומו. In a case of נ"ט בר נ"ט however, even if it would be בן יומו the food would still be permitted מעיקר הדין. It's only because of a minority opinion that we don't always permit pareve food in a dairy pot to be eaten with meat. Therefore when it's both אב"י and נ"ט בר נ"ט one would be permitted to eat this food with meat.

The חכמת אדם [f] says that one should not use a אב"י dairy pot if one intends on eating the food with meat. However if one does not have another pot available then one may use an אב"י dairy pot to cook pareve food to be eaten with meat לכתחלה. It is important to note that all of the above changes if one is cooking a sharp food.

There is another scenario that is מותר; if one cooked pareve food in a ב"י dairy pot one can place the food on a meat dish [g], however one should not pour directly from the dairy to the meat dish [h]. By this as well there is a discussion if one can cook the food in dairy pot with the intention of eating it on meat dishes.

The פמ"ג [i] says that one cannot and the פר"ה [j] says that one may do so לכתחלה. Again the חכמת אדם [k] says that one can be lenient if they are in a pinch.

When using different utensils at the same time must exercise extreme caution that no mix-ups occur and one doesn't accidentally do something that will make the dishes or the food non-kosher.

If one is stuck the best option is to use the dairy pot for something that will not be eaten at the same time as meat e.g. pareve appetizer or dessert. Additionally, if it's not very hot everyone will agree that it can even be placed in a meat dish.

[a] יו"ד סי' צ"ה סעי' ב'

[b] for more on this see Points to Ponder #3

[c] שם ועי' באו"ה שער ל"ד סי' ו' "מותר לכתחלה ליתנם בחלב אליבא דכולי עלמא"

[d] יש"ש חולין פ"ה סי' ס"ג

[e] שם אות י'

[f] כלל מ"ח אות ב'

[g] רמ"א שם

[h] ש"ך שם ס"ק ה' ועי' חכ"א כלל מ"ח סוף אות א'

[i] משב"ז ס"ק ה'

[j] אות ז'

[k] שם אות א'

## Rabbi Eliezer Schecter

**Question:** I made a pareve soup using fleishig utensils; may I warm the soup up in a Milchig microwave?

**Answer:** The first question that needs to be asked is had the pot been used for meat within 24 hours prior to making the soup? If the answer is yes it had been used for meat within the past 24 hours then the pot would be considered a בן יומו. We would then assume that the pareve soup is Fleishigs unless the soup is sixty times the meat cooked in the pot within the past 24 hours [a]. Being that it is Fleishig, one may not eat it with milk or warm it up in a Milchig microwave [b], but one would not have to wait after consuming it before eating Milchigs [c].

If the pot is not a בן יומו, then the contents of the pot are completely pareve and one may eat it or heat it up with milk [d]. This is all assuming the soup does not contain onions. Now we will discuss soup that contains onions.

The חולין in גמרא [e] states that if one cut a radish with a Fleishig knife the radish cannot be eaten with dairy. רש"י [f] explains that the reason for this is either that the knife may have meaty grease or that the sharpness of the knife can transfer the meat flavor from the knife into the radish through cutting. תוספות [g] wonders whether the sharpness of the radish can even renew the flavor from an בן יומו pot as we find by the Chiltus grain whose sharpness can renew the flavors in an בן יומו knife and make them flavorful again. The טור [h] brings opposing ראשונים as to whether this is true of the radish.

What we learned so far is that the radish may draw out flavor even from an בן יומו knife. Now concerning onions and other sharp foods, the בית יוסף [i] brings a disagreement between רבינו ברוך and רבינו יהיאל as to whether they share the status of radishes. The opinion of the רמ"א [j] is to be מהמר that all sharp foods can draw out flavor from an בן יומו pot through cutting

or through heat.

Therefore if there were onions in the soup that were cut with a Fleishig knife, those onions would contain the meat flavors from the blade that cut them even though the knife is an אינו בן יומו. However since it is impossible that there is more meat flavor in the onions than from the blade that cut the onions, all we would need to מבטל the meat flavor is, pareve soup that is sixty times the blade regardless of how many onions were cut [k]. Therefore in most applications the meat flavor would be בטל in the soup and the soup can be eaten or warmed with milchigs.

However the Halacha would differ when the onions were sautéed alone in the אינו בן יומו pot. In that case we must assume that all the onions were filled with meat flavor from the pot! To render the soup completely pareve we would then need sixty times all of the onion that were sautéed. However in most scenarios the pareve soup is not sixty times all the onion and the soup should not be warmed in a Milchig microwave.

In conclusion we learned;

- If the pot was a בן יומו, one would not be able to be warm it up in a Milchig microwave (unless it could be determined that the meat used in the previous 24 hours was less than a sixtieth of soup).
- If the pot was an אינו בן יומו then it would depend if there were onions or other sharp foods in the soup. If there were no sharp foods then the soup would be completely pareve.
- If there were onions cut with a fleishig knife, the soup would remain pareve as long as the soup was sixty times the size of the blade used.
- If the onions were sautéed in the pot the soup would be considered fleishig and may not be heated in a Milchig microwave, however one would not have to wait after eating the

soup before eating Milchigs.

כמבואר במחבר ורמ"א שו"ע יו"ד סי' צ"ד ס"ו [a]

וכמו שפסק הרמ"א שם בסי' צ"ה סעיף ב' דלכתחילה אין לאכול דבר שנתבשל בכלי בשר [b] עם חלב. ומ"מ בדיעבד עם כבר נתערב התבשיל עם חלב מותר לאכלה.

הרמ"א שם סי' פ"ט סעיף ג' ועי' מה שכתב הבית מאיר שם סי' פ"ט בביאור דברי הש"ך [c] סקי"ט. ואפ"י היתה בתוך הקדירה ממשות של בשר אין צריך להמתין וכדאיתא בהש"ך שם.

כן כתב הרמ"א שם בסי' צ"ה סעיף ב' [d]

דף קיב. [e]

ד"ה קישות [f]

ד"ה אגב חורפיה בלע [g]

שם סי' צ"ו הביאו המחלוקת המהר"ם והספר התורמות [h]

שם סי' צ"ז [i]

שם סעיף ב' וג' [j]

כמבואר מדברי הש"ך שם סק"ט [k]

## Rabbi Yosef Stern

**Question:** May one buy pre-cut fruit from a non-Kosher store?

**Answer:** There are two issues that arise concerning items that are cut with a non-Kosher knife [a]. The first is; if the knife had been previously used to cut non-Kosher food and wasn't properly cleaned afterwards, we need to be concerned that the remaining residue on the surface of the knife will come off when you cut the kosher item. This will be an issue no matter what kind of item you're cutting, and whether it is hot or cold. Being that this issue is only a question of the remaining residue coming off the knife, the שבלי הלקט says that if the fruit was already cut, we may assume that the residue came off onto the first few fruits cut, and those fruit would be בטל ברוב in the rest of the fruit which have no residue [b]. The second issue here is: if the knife was ever used to cut non-Kosher items while hot, flavor of the non-Kosher items would have been absorbed into the knife. That being the case, even though generally if one were to cut something cold there wouldn't be any issue, if the item now being cut is a דבר חריף [c] flavor will come out of the knife. This is a concern no matter how many fruit you cut [d].

Generally, if something was cut by a non-Jew we assume the knife to be non-Kosher, thereby posing the above issues [e]. However, if the establishment in which the fruit was cut only use these knives for fruit there wouldn't be any issue [f].

When buying cut fruit from a non-kosher store the first thing one would want to verify is, does the store have a special section where the fruit is cut using dedicated utensils. If this is not the case and there is a concern that the knife had been used for other things, then as long as they cut a lot of fruit and there aren't any fruits that qualify as a דבר חריף i.e. lemons [g], then it would also be permissible to buy them.

[a] עיין גמ' חולין דף קיב. ורש"י שם ד"ה קישות [b] הובא בב"ח סי' צו ד"ה כתב ב"י [c] עיין סי' צו סע' ב' [d] עיין סי' צו ש"ך ס"ק כ' [e] מבואר מהרמ"א בסע' א' [f] רמ"א סע' ב' [g] מחבר בסע' ד' ועיין בפר"מ על הט"ז ס"ק ט' שכתב שכל דבר שאינו נאכל לעצמו חשיב דבר חריף

## Rabbi Shmuel Katz

**Question:** May I eat lunch at the same table as my (non-Jewish) co-workers?

**Answer:** The משנה in חולין [a] tells us that it is prohibited to eat dairy while there is meat on the table. The reason given is that a person may come to eat them together. This includes not eating dairy next to someone who is eating meat [b]. The גמרא tells us that this would not apply if they are not familiar with one another [c]. This is because חז"ל were afraid that there may be some food shared during the course of the meal, and this is only likely if they were previously acquainted. We see that eating at one table with someone who is eating a food that you cannot currently eat may be problematic.

From your question I infer that your co-workers are eating non-kosher food. In that case, the ש"ך says [d] it would not be a problem, being that you would only accept an offer for kosher food, whereas non-kosher food you would instinctively decline [e]. However, if they are eating non-kosher bread then it may be problematic, because of its status as a staple [f]. This would also be a problem if he was eating kosher dairy at the same time you are eating meat.

In conclusion, if your tablemate is a colleague and the food is non-kosher bread (or kosher dairy) you would then need to use a "היכר". A היכר is a reminder not to eat his food. A couple of practical suggestions: 1) Place your food on a mat or napkin [g]. 2) Place an item that is not being used at your meal between both of your plates (e.g. an apple you plan to eat later [h] or a ring of keys [i]).

If the food looks kosher and [e] חז"ל סי' פה סק"ב [d] יו"ד סי' פה סק"ב [c] רש"י שם [b] שם קז [a] חולין קג. there is a possibility that you will forget and eat some then you may also need to place a heker as a reminder (פרי תואר סי' פה סק"א) [f] שם [g] שו"ע יו"ד סי' פה סעיף ב' [h] רמ"א שם [i] ט"ז שם סק"ד שצריך להיות "גבוה קצת"